

**CHARLES UNIVERSITY IN PRAGUE
FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC AND
POLITICAL STUDIES**

MASTER'S THESIS

Sex for Sale: Globalization and Human Trafficking

Author	Annmarie Aiello
Subject:	IEPS
Academic Year:	2008/2009
Supervisor:	Mgr. Petra Levrincova, LL.M.
Date Submitted:	22 May 2009

Annmarie Aiello

IEPS

Thesis Proposal

Completion Date: Summer Semester 2008

Title:

Human Trafficking in South Eastern Europe: Global Sex Trade

Statement:

How Globalization has enabled Human Trafficking for the purpose of Sexual exploitation in the Balkans since the fall of the Iron Curtain.

Content:

INTRODUCTION

General introduction to attract readers' attention, thesis statement, methodology, literature review, explanation of terms, structure of the work

PART I: The World is Changing. Is it all for the better?

1. Globalization and the World

- a. Background information on Globalization and how it is affecting the world

2. Beyond borders- How Globalization eases transportation between countries

- a. Explanation of origin, transit and destination countries
- b. Ease of transportation of goods—humans
- c. A case study from beginning to end- a typical women's journey. (I was planning on showing how a women begins in the country of Origin typically from Russia, Moldova or Romania, then enters the transit country which are in the Balkans and then ends up in the Destination country and beyond. It is to show the ease of crossing borders.)

3. The Global Economy

- a. How the Internet has increased the demand and the supply of trafficking

4. Health Consequences of Human trafficking

- a. Rise in HIV and other Sexual Transmitted Disease
- b. Physical Trauma to the body

PART II: Sex for Sale

- 1. Human Trafficking.**
 - a. Definition
 - b. Crime rate

- 2. The Emergence of Human Trafficking in the Balkans for Sexual Exploitation**
 - a. History from the fall of the Iron curtain through today

- 3. Organizations and the corruption behind trafficking**
 - a. How Organized Crime is the forerunner in human trafficking
 - b. How the Balkans have an grave issues with corruption correlating to human trafficking

- 2. “How did I end up here?”- Recruitment of Girls and Women**
 - a. Personal stories of trafficked girls
 - b. Methods of luring women into Trafficking rings

- 3. Country Reports**
 - a. Individual Country Reports
 - b. What NGOs and Local Governments are doing to help

CONCLUSION:

Conclusion, Recommendation

This thesis will explore all the problems that have arisen within the past 15 years in the Balkans with regard to Human Trafficking and more specifically for sexual exploitation. It will show how globalization opened the door and enabled this activity to continue under the radar. The problem needs to be addressed as it is continuing to grow as the world makes it easier to transport and also because of the capital gain involved. One day hopefully this will not be an issue that needs to be researched and discussed, until then raising awareness is the best one can do. To grasp the understanding of my intentions for this thesis, the following is a short summary of the problems, which will be dealt with throughout the paper.

Human Trafficking is defined as “the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, or the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.” (UNODC)

Human trafficking is world wide problem that no country is immune. The Balkans or South Eastern Europe has become known as the Fourth Wave of human trafficking. The Balkans did not become a major player in the trafficking of humans until 1991, with the breakup of the Soviet Union. The reason is linked to economic and political instability. The Balkans, due to recent wars have left many of the countries governed by weak governments and also prone to high levels of corruption. Corruption and Organized Crime are the leading movers in this worldwide epidemic. Human trafficking is now considered the third largest illegal moneymaking venture in the world after illegal weapons and drugs. The reason that the Balkans is interesting to examine is

because a few countries are both transit and origin countries. Women and girls are highly prone to falling into many of the traps because of the economic state in which they live and the desire to move up the economic ladder. Poverty is a major cause, because many of these women are desperate to support themselves and or family and want to believe that the job offered abroad such as maids, hotel employees, waitresses and bartenders will be the answer to their problems (Malarek).

Looking at the countries on a individual basis, analyzing why certain countries in South Eastern Europe are used as origin and transit countries. What makes Romania and Moldova more prone to luring women into the traps of human trafficking than Serbia and Bosnia along with the others. The same goes for why the transit countries are not where the girls come from. Regional Clearing Point has published the first annual report on the victims of human trafficking in this region. Looking at the report, I plan on analyzing the situation and also making recommendation such as implementing additions awareness seminars in schools to warn young women about the bonus ads that one day they might be inclined to respond. Other recommendations are NGOs educating local governments about the signs or trafficked women and possible how to enforce it. Each country has specific needs due to the difference in culture and governments.

Globalization is a forerunner, which is helping traffickers around the world. The development of the Internet has been one of the biggest factors in the growth of trafficking. People from every which part of the world are able to access websites which promote girls and communication between origin and destination countries are only a click away. The European Union and Schengen are also contributors with the lack of boarder control. It is the freedom of movement that allows people to cross borders and

is wonderful concept, however, it can lead to helping facilitate trafficking in humans. Traffickers are able to bring humans across borders with false identification, if any and run into very few concerns while crossing borders especially within the European Union.

DECLARATION:

I hereby declare that this thesis is my own work, based on the sources and literature listed in the appended bibliography. The thesis as submitted is 144,465 keystrokes long (including spaces), i.e. 76 manuscript pages.

Your name

Annmarie Aiello

Your signature



Date

18 May 2009

Table of Contents

Abbreviations and Acronyms.....	9
Introduction.....	10
Methodology.....	10
Literature Review	12
Structure	16
Chapter 1: The Modern Day Slave Trade.....	16
Measuring Today's Sex Trade	24
Albania	27
Bosnia and Herzegovina.....	31
Republic of Kosovo	35
Chapter 2: Trafficking in Human Beings: the business behind the trade	37
Chapter 3: Those behind the Trafficking trade.....	48
Chapter 4: Why Trafficking is Flourishing in Today's World?	60
European Union and Schengen	60
The Internet and Trafficking	67
Conclusion: The Worlds Response to the Globalized rise in Human Trafficking....	78
Abstract.....	81
Tables.....	82
Bibliography.....	91

Abbreviations and Acronyms:

ICMPD-International Centre for Migration Policy Development

IPTF- International Police Task Force

IO- International Organizations

IOM-International Organization for Migration

NATO- North Atlantic Treaty Organization

NGO- Non-Governmental Organizations

SFOR- NATO Stabilization Force in Bosnia

THB- Trafficking in Human Beings

UN-United Nation

UNODC- United Nation Office on Drugs and Crime

UNHCR- United Nations Higher Commission for Refugees

Interpol- International Criminal Police Organization

VoT- Victim of Trafficking

SEE- South Eastern Europe

BiH-Bosnia i Hercegovina

UNMIK-United Nations Mission in Kosovo

EULEX-European Union Rule of Law Mission in Kosovo

OSCE- Organizational Security and Co-operation in Europe

IDP-Internal Displaced Persons

UNHCR-United Nations Higher Commission for Refugees

HDI-Human Development Index

Introduction:

Methodology:

Throughout this paper secondary sources were the primary means of research, which were analyzed to create answers to why women are being falling into the ploys traffickers use more today than in the past. Secondary sources are also used to understand the business practices behind trafficking, which are highly connected to organized crime. Due the nature of trafficking in human beings and the connection to organized crime, there is a low level of safety for independent researchers to seek out primary information in both former trafficked victims and also those who traffic. Therefore most of the information on the practice was researched through secondary sources. All sources are based on the region of Eastern Europe mostly the former Soviet Union and the South Eastern Europe (SEE) and only for the use of sexual exploitation in women from the ages of 18 and older. Child trafficking, which is an additional issue in the region was not included throughout this report along with the other aspects of trafficking such as domestic labour and begging. Trafficking in this region for sexual exploitation only surfaced since the fall of the iron curtain and therefore there is a lack of empirical data prior. The empirical data has been conducted between the years of 2000 and present day, however, the majority of the data is in the early 2000s due to the time of print and the ever-changing nature of this topic. Empirical data on trafficking of human beings is scarce and not reliable especially taken from sources in SEE.

Primary sources were also used in analyzing the importance of technology and the internet as a way for trafficking to grow around the world. Visiting websites where trafficking is advertised through various methods was a prime way to get a first hand look on how trafficking women and selling them is practiced around the world. Websites used in research were either discovered through various web searches or mentioned in other

literature, which then were explored in-depth. Due to the nature of the internet, at the time of research and print all the websites cited were active and valid.

First hand experience and research was also used throughout this paper, as I was employed by the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) working on the Trafficking in Human Beings team in Vienna, Austria. The experience I gained working on human trafficking policy allowed me personal insight on the International Organizations (IO) approach to combating trafficking of human beings. Much of my first hand experiences used throughout this thesis have been from attending conferences and seminars on the topic of trafficking in human beings.¹ The lack of empirical data is the sole hinderers found throughout this research along with the lack of universal databases and definitions. In the conclusion there are reports on what is being done to combat Trafficking in Human Beings (THB) today and the efforts made by not only ICMPD, but also other international organizations and governmental agencies.

The experiences working for ICMPD's Trafficking in Human Beings team allowed me to work along with experts on migration policy on projects dealing with SEE and its relationship to trafficking throughout Europe. Throughout my time at ICMPD, I formed personal and professional relationships with experts studying human trafficking within Europe and networked at conventions, professional dinners, and seminars were conveyed throughout this thesis.

¹ The International Centre for Migration Policy Development's 1st Transnational Seminar for Development of a transnational referral mechanism for victims of trafficking between countries of origin and destination held in Prague, Czech Republic on 24-25 March 2009. I also attended International Organization for Migration's Final Ministerial Conference on the Guidelines for the Collection of Data on Trafficking in Human Beings, Including Comparable Indicators held on 23-24 February 2009.

Literature Review:

With the nature of this research and heavy reliance on secondary sources, it is imperative to understand the point of view and background on each of the main pieces of literature used throughout this thesis. Since every work has a different account of trafficking in human beings such as statistical information it is difficult to conclude the accurate quantitative measures. “The Natashas” written by Victor Malarek (2003) gives the most comprehensible background on the trade of selling and transporting trafficking victims. His work although written as both an academic work and novel sheds light on the epidemic throughout the world. It does not only focus on the Balkan region and Eastern Europe, however, many of his stories and accounts deal with the fourth wave specifically. Malarek’s ability to speak Russian is helpful in his accounts with former trafficked victims. Even though the work has been published five years previous to this research, many laws and statutes have changed giving the work a slight outdated view of statistical and legal issues, although “The Natashas” is one of the only pieces of literature that also focuses on the breaking ground or transit destination in the trafficking routes. It is also clear that Malarek is aware of technology and globalization probing and enabling the market of trafficking. This work is a great source as an introduction to the epidemic and gives researchers a place to continue to explore the ways of trafficking syndicates. It is written in a similar style to Louisa Waugh’s “Selling Olga”(2006) where the structure is a novel rather than an academic work. Waugh’s work is a collection of stories from her travels and research; however, all information is written in her perspective from personal travels and tales. There is limited new information that has not been discussed in other collections of literature on the topic, however, a large percentage of her travels and stories take place in the Balkans.

“Sex Trafficking”, by Kathryn Farr (2005) is a valid source of the breakdown of trafficking practices and those who partake in the trade. It does not strictly focus on the

victims of trafficking, which much of the literature available does, but also on the traffickers' perspective on why and how they become involved. Organized crime is also explained for each organized crime unit, specifically ethnicity and how it runs and incorporates trafficking into its practices. "Sex Trafficking" also sheds cultural and historical evidence on a main topic of military and trafficking, something that is crucial when analyzing why the Balkans became such a strong region for trafficking following the Yugoslavian Wars and the Kosovo Crisis. Since most of the information is not time sensitive the issue information is still valid three years after publication unlike many other works on this topic.

A very recent work, "Human Trafficking, Human Security, and The Balkans" edited by H. Richard Friman and Simon Reich (2007) focuses on primarily the Balkan region especially Albania, where trafficking is on the rise and little is being successfully done in combating the trade. Its focus is on the combating procedures in the region and also the policies implemented toward human trafficking rather than evaluating why it is continuing to grow.

The work, "Pornography: Driving the Demand for Trafficking", edited by David E. Guinn (2007) is the only work that links pornography to trafficking. This work is presented with various authors and it re-accounts a roundtable conference. There are many valid points of linking trafficking to pornographic sites, however, the work is largely dealing with prostitution and does not separate the difference between voluntary prostitution and forced prostitution. It claims that using prostitutes to create pornographic material creates a forced labour market, which is not discredited but not in theory with this thesis. On the other hand, this work gives accreditation to my primary research on internet websites that deal with pornographic material and its link to trafficking.

Structure:

This paper will begin to explore essential information on human trafficking and modern day slavery. The questions of *What, Who, How and Why* the practice of human trafficking is flourishing today especially in South Easter Europe is touched upon. The paper will begin with exploring the “The Arizona Market” in Bosnia, which will give insight to what the trade is encompassing. The three countries of Albania, Bosnia and Herzegovina and the newly Republic of Kosovo are represented in further details on the specifics and empirical data of the trade. The next sections looks upon the fundamentals of how the sex trade is conducted, exploring the process from recruitment through destination and how new information technologies are easing the process. Once the journey of a trafficked victim is explained, paper next tackles the traffickers and those who are enabling the trade to continue. Globalization, organized crime, influx of military, and international peacekeepers is keeping the trade flourishing and their roles are discussed. The next chapter will focus on the different factors that are leading to why the trade is continuing to grow each day despite various efforts. The chapter is divided into two sections, the first deals with the political front. The European Union and Schengen Agreement section will examine the laws and structure that embodies the European Union and the Schengen territory and how it is enabling trafficking within its boundaries. The second section provides information on how new information technology is creating a world- wide venue for trafficking. It explores the connection with the internet and pornography and examines the definition of human trafficking now that imagines of humans can be transported worldwide. The conclusion uses current policies that are in the process of becoming implemented to combat trafficking in human beings along with the importance of education. Education is the key to fighting globalization’s effects on human trafficking.

Globalization, which is rapidly changing the socio-economic and political fronts in South Eastern Europe, is enabling human trafficking to flourish especially for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Human trafficking is an epidemic facing nearly every country in the world, however, South East Europe remains an important region to gain insight on the issue of human trafficking as military conflicts and governmental changes are in consent progress. As the region's political sphere is changing it brings forth change in social behavior which is steams from an increase in globalization. One of the major social behaviors that is changing is an increase in organized crime due to the instability in socio-economics of the region. Globalization is a key aspect to why trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation is thriving.

Chapter 1- Modern Day Sex Slave Trade

This chapter gives an overview the trafficking in human beings and the modern day slave trade that is practiced throughout the world. The question of “what is human trafficking?” will be discussed in depth and how globalization under the definition, which is “Worldwide movement toward economic, financial, trade, and communications integration. Globalization implies opening out beyond local and nationalistic perspectives to a broader outlook of an interconnected and inter-dependent world with free transfer of capital, goods, and services across national frontiers.”² is changing the former methods that human trafficking was conducted. A brief background on South East Europe and the dynamics that shape the area are discussed. The “Arizona Market” in Bosnia will be introduced as the main thread showing how the results from military conflict, a change in politics, rise in organized crime and ease of transportation all support human trafficking trade to occur in South East Europe.

“No one shall be held in slavery or servitude; slavery and the slave trade shall be prohibited in all their forms” from Article 4, Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The world prides itself on the abolition of slavery; however, slavery is still practiced throughout the world in spite of laws instilled in every country around the world. The 1948 United Nations Declaration of Human Rights along with the 1956 *UN Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery* are to internationally stop the trade and prevent it from occurring in today’s society. The practice of owning another human being continues today; however, it has moved underground and disguised as human trafficking. Human Trafficking either for the purpose of sexual exploitation, domestic labour or forced labour are all facets of modern day slavery. Modern

² globalization" BusinessDictionary.com. WebFinance, Inc.
<<http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/globalization.html>>. (Accessed on May 17, 2009)

day slavery is as horrific as the former, well-known Trans-Atlantic slave trade in the early 17th century and the conditions are no better. Modern day slavery affects millions of people today and with the rise of technology from globalization slavery is flourishing with ease and little detection.

One can partake in the modern day slave trade at any given moment with internet access and the correct available information. For instance a typical Sunday morning may begin as such: wake up, turn on computer, pay bills via the internet, order breakfast to be delivered within 15 minutes and log into a website where you can search and purchase a women for your own sexual exploitation. It is that simple with the rise of technology and globalization for an average person around the world to enter the realm of human trafficking either as the initial trafficker or a consumer. Granted the increase of globalization has provided advancement within the business, tourist, and government sectors; each advancement endures setbacks.

Technology advancements such as Skype and email allow communication to flourish across international borders. Society has simplified with the increase of outsourcing and the lack of need to leave home to accomplish many everyday tasks. Shopping online without having to leave home, emailing work projects to others, paying bills, managing bank accounts and being able to cross international borders with limited restrictions are all examples of how globalization is prevalent in each and everyone's daily life. As much as globalization has benefited society and makes professional and personal life more efficient, there are aspects that have a harsher reality. Even though on the mass scale, globalization has played a positive role in the development of developing countries around the world and improving standards of living, there is a small sector that globalization hinders and cannot be overlooked.

The human trafficking trade has flourish as globalization continues to spread across the world. Human trafficking is defined under the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children as:

The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of person, by means of threat or use of force of other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation includes, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.

Institutions and scholars have begun to notice the dangers that are prevalent to society under the realm of globalization. The United States of America', former Senator and current Secretary of State, Hillary Rodney Clinton discussed the negative outcomes brought on by globalization in a speech. She presented, regardless of the trade, globalization has brought out an ugly side of human nature.

“Now that we can move goods and people with such ease all over the world, it is very hard to know what it is that we are transporting, where it's supposed to end up. This is true for human beings, it's true for drugs, its true for weapons, it's true for terrorism, and it is something we have to come to grips with. I think we should be looking at trafficking, not only as an evil, in and of itself, that the world has to combat, but as a part of the problems that we face because of globalizations.”³

When analyzing globalization under the conditions of human trafficking the positives are far and few between.

The globalization boom began in South Eastern Europe occurred following the fall of the Iron Curtain and then re-emerged following the conclusion of the civil wars that plagued the region in the 1990s. The same trend occurred with the fall of the Soviet Union and the creation of the new Soviet Independent states. The sense of desperation was imminent throughout both the Eastern Bloc and the Former Yugoslavia. A once communistic region now was now plagued with unemployment and fear of the unknown. Women were the most affected by the changes that occurred around them. Despite the economic woes, the concept and glorified image of the West was one of the main drivers that drove young women to

³ Gilbert King, Women, child for sale: The new slave trade in the 21st century. (New York : Chamberlain Bros ,2004) 181.

succumb to trafficker's ploys. The desire to experience life in the West, a life of wealth and freedom, was merely a dream for decades for those living in the Soviet Union and Former Yugoslavia.

The independent states that were once part of the former Yugoslavia region have received much support both monetarily and in the form of protection and security from European States and the United States of America. It is not uncommon in post-conflict zones for human trafficking to flourish; however, in the past 20 years none thrived to the extent as the Balkans. In Bosnia-Herzegovina and Kosovo, the international presence consists of the NATO-led Stabilization Force, the UN-led International Police Force and the European Union Police Mission. These forces are pervasive within the country. Besides, police protection, monetary aid has been given to the region by international financial institutions, the United States and the European Union.⁴

One of the most notorious displays of human trafficking in the Balkans that also is an effect of globalization is the "Arizona market". The "Arizona market" began after the 1990's war in the Former Yugoslavia. The intention behind the "Arizona Market" was to bring people of Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH), Croatia and Serbia together in order to sell and buy goods without prejudice. The conception of the idea began by an American general who was serving as an officer in the United Nations mission in Bosnia. He believed that free trade would bring together people who had ethnic tension and gave them a space to interact, leaving all the past issues behind and to start to trust each other. The concept was simple. "One who buys together does not die together"⁵. The NATO-led Implementation Force (IFOR) turned the idea into a reality in 1996.⁶ The town Brcko in Bosnia near to both the

⁴ Nicole Lindstrom, "Regional Sex Trafficking Networks and International Intervention in the Balkans". (International Studies Association: Montreal, Quebec, Canada, 2004) 3

⁵ Jyothi Kanics, "Arizona Market: Woman for Sale," (Stop-traffic. News/Bosnia, 2000) 1

⁶ Marko Hajdinjak, "Smuggling in Southeast Europe", (Center for the Study of Democracy Sofia, Bulgaria 2002) 54

Croatian and Serbian border became the ideal stop to set up this free trade market. The market, which encompasses a five square mile area, lays aside a highway that has since been named the Arizona highway. Once the area was deemed safe with the removal of mines, the market began operations. The market resembles an American gold rush town back in the 1880s. There are narrow alleyways and fronted with pinewood. At the entrance, a sign greets the customers, “ Our thanks in the US Army for supporting the development of this market”.⁷ The Market was considered a success as people came in hordes to buy CDs, clothes, cigarettes, and everyday household products.⁸ Today people often refer to this market as the Wal-Mart of Bosnia.⁹ The Arizona Market exemplifies the extreme globalization that followed the Civil war in the Balkan region.

In theory and in practice, for a short time the Market was a step in the right direction and it was successful for sometime; however, over time the Arizona market became a stomping ground for organized crime especially in the selling and purchasing of persons for sexual exploitation. The Arizona Market is currently operational and one can buy the everyday items legally; be as that may, it is just a front for the real transactions that take place behind the closed doors. Humans are the main item out of all the accessible black market items that are accessible for purchase; however, it does not stop at humans. One can purchase stolen cars, illegal drugs and nearly anything that is contraband is for sale at the market. Even though it is a known fact that the Arizona Market is creating more harm than good for the Bosnian economy and the local citizens, the intentions of bring people from three culturally diverse backgrounds that under normal circumstances are predisposed to great hatred steaming from the lack of ethnic tolerance, did prevail. The success of bringing Croats, Bosniaks (Bosnian nationals of Islamic faith), and Serbs together, regardless if the

⁷ Victor Malarek, The Natashas: Inside the New Global Sex Trade. (New York: Arcade Publishing, 2004) 36

⁸ Kanics 1.

⁹ Malarek 36.

business practices are ethical, is the reason why the Office of the High Representative of the International Community in Bosnia has yet to close the doors on Arizona.¹⁰ The Arizona Market shows how human trafficking and organized crime can bring together people who are sworn enemies under normal circumstances and how they can work together under a common goal and for the right price. Furthermore, another prime example of this is the clash between Albanians and Serbians. These two ethnic groups have spent most of their history despising each other and in perpetual conflict throughout the late 20th Century and early 21st Century. Despite mass ethnic cleansing from Serbs to ethnic Albanians, members of organized crime organization from both ethnicities come together and to exploit women. Aside from the Albanians, the Serbs and the Bosniaks also are able to cooperate due the common goal of making money, by exploiting persons.¹¹

The women found at the Arizona market are brought into Bosnia through various recruitment techniques. They are coerced and deceived and believe then they are heading to a Western European Country for employment opportunities such becoming a waitress, maid and other legal occupations. Many of the girls don't realize where they are or what they are expected to do until they wind up in the Arizona Market.¹² Once at the Arizona market, girls are put on a stage and forced to wear different costumes and parade around for potential buyers. The sex trade found in the Arizona market takes places at various nightclubs that line the area. Nightclubs' names such as "Las Vegas" and "Acapulco", once again show the mass form of western integration into the Balkans. The females that are brought into these clubs are often treated like cattle for sale. They receive numbers, which they hold up while walking around stage undressed. The potential buyers have the opportunity to examine and

¹⁰ Hajdinjak 54.

¹¹ Malarek 103.

¹² Malarek 36.

touch the girls before making a final purchase.¹³ Once bought they will begin their horrific journey as a slave for sexual exploitation whether they will remain in the Balkans or move onto Western Europe, the United States or even Israel. The girls that are not purchased instantly at the Arizona market remain in Bosnia near the market. They are forced to live in conditions that are slave like in many cases without proper food or water. They are forced to dance and service clients in the area many of who are in police enforcement and international peacekeepers. They are bound to stay until purchased.¹⁴ Unfortunately some of the girls never make it out of the Arizona Market alive. There have been reports of trafficked girls who were murdered by the overwhelming organized crime that controls the area. According to the Organization for Security in Cooperative Europe (OSCE), two girls were found naked in a river close to the Arizona Market; the girls murder had the marking of organized crime. Their hands were tied behind their back along with their feet bound in concrete and tape over their mouths.¹⁵ The growing influx of organized crime controlling the area and the human trafficking business in the Arizona Market causes a grave threat to the humanity and safety of the area. The Arizona Market shows how globalization in the Balkans is prevalent; however, most of the visitors are from South Eastern Europe. Human trafficking within the Balkans has a greater spectrum of globalization spanning throughout Western Europe. The Arizona Market embodies all aspects of Human Trafficking and its relationship to globalization. It shows the prevalence of organized crime, the crossing of international borders, the presence of international police and peacekeeping forces, corrupt government officials, and the victims, which continue to be the forefront of trafficking in beings.

¹³ Malarek 37.

¹⁴ ibid

¹⁵ Vesna Nikolic-Ristanovic, "*Sex Trafficking: The Impact of War, Militarism and Globalization in Eastern Europe*" (Michigan Feminist Studies: 2003; 17; Gender Watch) 1

Those who study, research and become knowledgeable on human trafficking and its practices are aware of human trafficking throughout the world; however, the average person only sees prostitution increasing within their region. To the general public the two are often indistinguishable. Trafficking of beings for sexual exploitation is classified as force prostitution. There is a clear distinction between women who are willing and choose the sex industry and the women who are being forced as defined under human trafficking. Prostitution is defined as one who engages or creates an occupation in sexual relations for money.¹⁶ Trafficked victims appear as prostitutes whether working on the streets, in brothels or in other areas of the sex industry; however, they do not receive monetary gain from their actions. All profits are returned to the trafficker; therefore, the victims do not fall under the formal definition of prostitution. The customers who are looking to hire a prostitute often disregard the notion that some of these women are not choosing this lifestyle by choice but rather by force. Classifying all women working in the sex industry into one category as prostitutes presents a grave hinder in eradicating the trade of human beings. “So often cars would slow down and people would yell, ‘You are a whore. This is no job for a girl like you.’ But they never stopped to ask if they could help”, Stefa, a Moldovan Teenager Trafficked into Italy said.¹⁷ Stefa’s account of being forced into the sex industry shows the naivety and/or lack of concern from the general public toward the trafficking issue. Until there is a clear general knowledge that many women working in the sex industry do so under distress and force, there will little advancement from concerned citizens to change and stop using trafficked women.

¹⁶ "prostitution." Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary. 2009. Merriam-Webster Online. May 2009 <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/prostitution> (Accessed on 16 May 2009)

¹⁷ Malarek 99.

Measuring Human Trafficking and Insight to Three South Eastern Europe Countries

The trafficking epidemic effects nearly ever country in the world. According to the UN Office on Drugs and Crime Database on Human Trafficking Trends, there are 127 countries where humans are being trafficked from and are exploited in 137 countries.¹⁸ Each country that has been plagued by human trafficking falls into a category depending on the role the country plays. Each country is placed into origin, transit, or destination classification. Origin countries are the states where the process begins during the recruitment stage. Typically origin countries are either poor, developing country with large gender inequality or economically depressed and/or going through an economic transition.¹⁹ A transit country is the country where the victim is transported through before reaching the destination country. The destination country is where the victim will face the most exploitation, however transit countries are often the first place a victim will encounter sexual exploitation.²⁰

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Database on Human Trafficking Trends more commonly known as the Trafficking Database compiled by various source institutions. This database mission is to establish a comprehensive analysis of the trends in human trafficking using the reports of institutions involved in researching human trafficking.²¹ These institutions record their findings based certain variables such as the name of country, the type of country (origin, transit or destination), the demographics of the victims, and the type of exploitation. The findings are then calculated based on the number of institutions that have the same data. The UNODC rates each country as: Very High, High,

¹⁸ United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns" (2006) 17

¹⁹ Kathryn Farr, Sex Trafficking: The Global Market in Women and Children. (New York: Worth Publishers, 2004) 154

²⁰ Farr 154

²¹ "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns" UNODC 37

Medium, Low and Very Low based on the incidence of reporting for all three categories.²² The distribution of Rankings is found in Table I. Each state mentioned can fall in one or all categories depending on the findings. Europe is broken into the sub-regions of Western Europe, Eastern Europe and South Eastern Europe, which are involved in all three categories. (Table 2)

By the time that a trafficked person is at their destination country, the victim has spent many months illegally crossing borders and forced into prostitution and other sexual activities. The process begins long before one leaves their home country. The recruitment process varies in individual cases. Each victim has a unique story about how he/she was coerced into this life; however, there are norms and patterns that exist based on hearing and researching individuals' stories. A prevalent way that a person is tricked into a life of forced slavery is by a false job opportunity. Due to the high levels of poverty, leaving home to support a family is the only option for survival. The desperation to have money to survive blinds many of truly researching the type of the jobs they are offered.

The transformation from communist economy to a market economy has not fared well for females. During Communism, females had an equal opportunity in the work force and employment among women was high; however, during the shift into a free market economies females felt it was a prior obligation and chose to leave the work force. Younger females are the greatest demographic effected by the transition. This generation has experienced the highest levels of poverty and the lack of formal education, which are leading causes for vulnerability in the recruitment phase of trafficking.²³

²² "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns", UNODC 117.

²³ Tanja Stirbu, et.al "EU-Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe" (Hamburg Institute of International Economics: Germany, 2004) 13

South Eastern Europe has an overlap of origin, transit and destination countries.²⁴ This makes the region distinct from other geographic regions that face the trials and tribulations of human trafficking. The Balkans have been notorious in the trafficking sector as countries of transit; however, in the past few years more and more cases are indicating that South Eastern Europe is becoming a hot stop for recruitment. There has been westward shift in origin countries. Origin countries in the past were mainly isolated to those of the former Soviet Bloc. According to Table 3 published by the Regional Clearing Point in their 2nd Annual Report of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe, the more traditional origin countries such as the Ukraine, Moldova, and Romania reported a drop in victims from 2000 to 2004. Traditional transit countries: Serbia, Macedonia, and Bosnia and Herzegovina showed a drastic increase in national victims.²⁵

Although South Eastern Europe is a sub-region of Europe, each state represented has individual characteristics that differ from the others. The countries Reports following of three South Eastern European countries, Albania, The Province of Kosovo (currently the Republic of Kosovo) and Bosnia and Herzegovina will give insight to the problems and themes that are shifting the trends from transit to origin and/or destination. The data and figures given are only based on those victims who received assistance from a collection of various Non-Government Organizations. The data could show higher numbers due to the fact that there are many victims who have not spoken out against the crimes and or have not been identified yet. The correlation between education level of victims and economic status has also shifted over time due to globalization and advancements in the region; however, the level of trafficking victims has increase.²⁶ Bulgaria and Romania are omitted from the country reports due to their accession into the European Union. The newest Member States

²⁴ “Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns” UNODC 18-20

²⁵ Surtees 44

²⁶ Surtees 13

have caused a shift in the practices of trafficking due to the fact that European Union citizens do not need a visa to enter another EU state. Each of these governments and the non-government organizations that play a role in human trafficking protection, prevention and assistance have different responsibilities and methods that relate to the country at hand.

Albania-

Albania is a non-Slavic nation in South Eastern Europe. Its location is optimal for transportation of trafficked persons as it shares its Southern border with Greece and is only 81 kilometers off the coast of Italy. Due to the transition in government from a dictatorship to a pluralistic system, human trafficking became a developing hindrance that plagues the state's welfare. Albania's social and political system poses restrictions for the organizations in data research and public awareness.²⁷

Albania's continuing problem with human trafficking for sexual exploitation involves only females. Since 2000, there have been no reports according to Regional Clearing Point²⁸ of any male victims with the intention of sexual exploitation. Within the years of 2000 to 2004 there have been 1539 females trafficked from Albania.²⁹ These 1539 women were Albanian nationals who were recruited under false pretexts. In Albania the average age of a female trafficked is between 18 to 25; however, between 2003 and 2004 there was a 2.5% increase in trafficking of minors and a decrease of 1.5% of trafficked victims over the age of 25.³⁰ There is no great discrepancy between the other states in SEE on the gender and age.

²⁷ Richard Friman and Simon Reich, Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans, (University of Pittsburg Press, 2007) 96

²⁸ The Regional Clearing Point (RCP) was established as a subsector of the Stability Pact Task Force on Trafficking in Human Beings. The main goal for RCP was to contribute to improved counter-trafficking programmes and policy through a better understanding of the trafficking phenomenon in the South-Eastern Europe, with particular attention to the needs and experiences of victims.

²⁹ Rebecca Surtees, "Second Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe" (Regional Clearing Point, IOM 2005) 59

³⁰ *ibid*

Whether the victim resides in a rural town or urban city does not have any correlation to trafficking. Urban areas have been increasing as the source of victims in Albania. In the past, rural areas were the prime location for recruiting girls, since poverty was more prevalent. The gap has been narrowed between the locations, as there is now only a few percent difference between rural and urban residents. Urban areas are becoming more populated due to the shift in urban migration. The poverty levels in urban areas are often as severe as in the rural areas, and the victims are just as interested in migrating abroad.³¹ The most common locations for trafficked Albanian victims are the cities in the Southern part such as Vlora, Berat, and Fieri.³² (See Table 4).

There is easy access to both Greece and Italy, and in the cities of Vlora and Durres traffickers have established a base of operations to allow for transportation and accommodations for the victims before they are trafficked internationally. The transportation routes have been rerouted since 2002. In 2002, regulations were implemented to protect the waters between Italy and Albania. These efforts have forced traffickers to reroute the victims overland to avoid detections from coast guards.³³ Most of the victims leaving Albania do not hold valid documents, if any, and must cross borders where there is no border control. Crossing through wooded areas and over mountains are physically demanding on the victims; however, it is the most secure way of not getting caught by officials. Italy is still the main destination for Albanian victims; however, their travels since 2004 have included Greece as the first location. In overland transport, 72% of trafficked victims in 2004 were transported from Gjirokaste, Albania, which lies in the Southern region, which is the boarding town of Greece.³⁴ Once trafficked into a European Union Member State, the ease of transport

³¹ “First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe” (Regional Clearing Point/IOM, 2003) 61

³² Friman 101.

³³ Surtees 71

³⁴ First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe. 71

increases. The capital city of Albania, Tirana, is not at the top of the list of cities with the most trafficked victims; however, it is the main location for illegal trafficking business. Most of the trafficking bosses reside in Tirana and it is also where most of the money laundering occurs.³⁵

Poverty is noted³⁶ as the main factor why victims are willing to migrate from Albania for work. Even though the majority of victims come from highly improvised areas, the quest for money is not the driving motivation for women. The concept of marriage is highly looked upon in Albanian cultural and traffickers use this notion to their advantage. Traffickers will present themselves as a suitor for marriage and deceitfully lure the victims into migrating with them, which does not end in marriage but sexual exploitation. Marriage also is an escape option to leave a family or social situation that is not ideal for victims.³⁷

Poverty levels are connected to the educational levels of the victims. The less of a formal education which one receives increases the risk of being recruited for trafficking. The majority of trafficked victims, around 85%, from Albania have received only primary education.³⁸ According to the Ministry of Education, in 2006, the enrollment of both boys and girls in secondary school was only 55% of Albanian population.³⁹ The lack of education has an impact on all facets of human trafficking from the traffickers to the prevention and reintegration efforts. Traffickers view victims with less of an education as ideal due the lack of necessary skills to contribute to the legal economy of the state. These victims are unaware of the tactics used by traffickers during the recruitment phase and they are also less likely to undermine the traffickers by fighting back and escaping once recruited. These victims understand that they do not have the necessary means of supporting themselves; therefore, if

³⁵ *ibid*

³⁶ As noted in footnote 24 with the fall of Communism and females no longer being involved in the workforce

³⁷ *ibid* 65

³⁸ *ibid* 62

³⁹ United States, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labour, Country Report on Human Rights Practices in Albania (Washington: Department of State, 2008)

they are assisted and returned to Albania they have a higher chance of becoming re-trafficked. Education is the key to diminishing the supply of trafficked victims in Albania.⁴⁰

The variables of poverty, concept of marriage, and education levels, allow the traffickers to recruit women easily. There is no safe place for women to reside in order to protect themselves from potential recruitment. Families are not a safety net for females in Albania. In 2004, 88.5% of victims were residing with family when recruited. Albania has limited resources for institutions and therefore many still live with extended family regardless of the conditions.⁴¹ It is the culture in Albania for women to reside at home until marriage and if a girl leaves home before marriage the trafficker believes it must be a method to escape the horrors faced when living home. This vulnerability aids the traffickers during recruitment. Regardless of their living situation, unemployment is a common trend among those trafficked out of Albania. The desperation for work drives females to accept jobs abroad.

The increasing use of females as recruiters has not affected Albania. Women in Albania are for the most part recruited by men of Albanian heritage and that they have a preexisting relationship with the recruiter. The relationship can range from a family member or current boyfriend. This is alarming as in prevention measures it is more difficult to warn women about men who they believe are safe and honest. Since these men are not random strangers, the recruiter knows how to convince the women and use their relationship with the potential victim to their advantage.

Albania is significantly an origin country; however, due to the proximity to Italy and Greece, Albania is an important transit country as well. Foreign nationals who have been assisted in Albania for human trafficking are on a decline. In the past the most common nationals who would be transported through Albania were Bulgarian, Romanian, and

⁴⁰ Surtees 63

⁴¹ *ibid* 67

Moldovan women for sexual exploitation.⁴² The accession of Bulgaria and Romania into the European Union gave traffickers great ease during transportation, since Bulgarian and Romanian citizens do not need visas to enter another EU state. These national victims do not need visas to cross into other European member states, creating a safer and less riskier trip. Albania has been eliminated from the travel route. The limited number of foreign victims whom were assisted in Albania during entered Albania without documentation and through Serbia. The majority of victims were promised work in Italy and Greece.⁴³

Bosnia and Herzegovina-

Civil war engulfed Bosnia and Herzegovina from 1992- 1995. Wartime rape was a common practice among the soldiers and the innocent female victims during this time. Dayton Peace Agreements signed in 1995 ended the atrocities of war, but the sexual exploitation of women flourished in BiH. The Dayton Peace agreement opened the borders to international peacekeepers. Peacekeepers and military presence have been linked to an increase in human trafficking, especially in BiH. Bosnia suffers from high level of unemployment and poverty especially for the female population. There is a 45.5 percent rate of unemployment among Bosnian women with 25 percent of them living under poverty.⁴⁴ The human trafficking problem in Bosnia and Herzegovina pertains mostly with foreign national victims. Bosnia and Herzegovina has become the most distinctive transit and destination country in the Balkans despite the levels of poverty and unemployment.

There are three main reasons why Bosnia and Herzegovina rose to the top as a significant location in the late 1900s and early 2000s for the trafficking of humans for sexual exploitation. The first is the emergence of the UN peacekeeping troops, which open the

⁴² Surtees 91

⁴³ Surtees 95

⁴⁴ Collateral Damage: The Impact of Anti-Trafficking Measures on Human Rights around the World”, (Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW) 2007) 68.

market for prostitution. The Arizona Market plays a great role in the trafficking patterns in Bosnia. The Arizona Market is the most infamous venue for trafficking and organized crime; however, in BiH there are other similar markets such as “Virginia” near the northeastern town of Kalesija.⁴⁵ Organized crime controls these markets, which is the second factor in BiH. The end of the war brought instability in government and the political arena. Organized crime reaped the benefits of porous borders within the Balkans and also the lack of political interference. The organized crime groups seized the opportunity and the location of BiH to transport humans from the East to the West. Bosnia’s geographic location is prime as a transit destination, due to the ease of multiple routes to EU member states.⁴⁶

The number of foreign national victims that were assisted in Bosnia from January 200 to December 31, 2004 was an alarming number of 846 victims. During the same time period there was only 54 assisted BiH national victims. These 900 victims were females. There are no reports of national or foreign male victims in BiH.⁴⁷ Human trafficking is a fairly recent problem that faces BiH. In 1998, there were zero official reported cases of human trafficking.⁴⁸

Minors, children under the age of 18, are being sought out by recruiters in BiH for sexual exploitation. Minors accounted for 58% of BiH nationals assisted in 2004.⁴⁹ The foreign nationals that were assisted in BiH were between the ages of 18-25, which is consistent with the findings in the region. There is a shift in the age demographic of foreign victims assisted in BiH, over time the age has been increasing. Minors hold a small percentage of assisted victims. The age reported is at the time of assistance, there is no information documenting the age at time of recruitment.

⁴⁵ Friman 84

⁴⁶ Collateral Damage 69

⁴⁷ Surtees 114.

⁴⁸ Friman 81

⁴⁹ Surtees 114

The recruited are alarmingly minors, those who are under the age of 18 and make up half of the assisted BiH victims. Minors are easy targets for recruiters due to the lack of formal education. The extent of education any victim possessed was that of a high school education. In 2003, only 11.8 percent of victims held a high school education.⁵⁰ The number of victims in 2004 whom completed a primary school education and those who did not finish primary school doubled. BiH enrollment in school is a cause of concern as education is a preventive measure in recruitment of victims.

Victims assisted in BiH consist of various different nationalities. Table 5 displays the breakdown of origination of nationals. Romania has the greatest decrease of nationals assisted in BiH, which can be explained by the less stringent visa requirements entering other European Union states. Romania entered the EU in 2007, opening the doors of travel for EU nationals. The majority of the origin countries consist of urban dwells, which is represented in the distribution of victims assisted in BiH. There is a stable rate of approximately 80% of victims who were recruited in the urban setting. Moldova is the only exception as their majority demographic resides in rural areas.⁵¹

The journey to BiH as a destination country begins in the origin nation and then to Serbia before ending their journey in BiH. BiH borders Serbia to the west and merely all victims are transported through Belgrade or Vojvodina, Serbia. The vast amount of dense wooden unguarded areas that are present between the Serbian and Bosnia border create a level of ease for traffickers to transport females. In the past, trafficked victims traveled in packs along with an escort into Bosnia. The borders are becoming more secure; therefore, a man traveling with multiple females draws attention to authority. In order to avoid detection from the authorities, traffickers are limiting the number of women transported at a particular

⁵⁰ ibid 141

⁵¹ Surtees 121

time. In 2004, 42.6% of the victims in Bosnia were trafficked alone; this is a 17% increase since 2003.⁵²

Bosnia and Herzegovina's distinctive feature is that many of the trafficked victims were aware of their destination of BiH. Bosnia and Herzegovina is an acceptable location for employment unlike Serbia and Kosovo according to the victims assisted. Table 6 shows the distribution of victims and their intended place of employment. Keeping consistent with the rest of the region, females are recruited for employment as waitresses, domestic work and surprisingly in the sex arena. Many women who are recruited to work in BiH understand that they will be employed as sex workers; however, they are not prepared to be exploited. IOM reported that 49 of the victims they assisted in 2003 accepted the position aware of the industry. This number increased in 2004.⁵³ Bosnia and Herzegovina has the highest number of victims intended to migrate to BiH.⁵⁴ The other transit countries in South Eastern Europe host victims who believe that their journey from home country to their destination country is direct.

The gender dynamic of the recruiter has changed over the years of 2003 and 2004. Although men have historically been the principle recruiters in the emerging origin states of South Eastern Europe, female recruiters and male/female couples are responsible for more than half of the recruitment of BiH nationals. The relationship of the recruiter to the victim has warranted concern in raising awareness to potential victims. The growing trend states that the victims know and trust their recruiter. The growth of friends and family as recruiters increased as mere acquaintances decreased. Victims trust family and friends; therefore, do not believe that they will steer them into a life of servitude and especially the sex industry.

⁵² *ibid*

⁵³ *ibid* 128

⁵⁴ *ibid*

The crossing of international borders does not restrict human trafficking. BiH victims are internally trafficked and often never leave the borders. Internal trafficking uses the same techniques in exploitation and abuse in order to keep the victim from disobeying or escaping. Internal trafficking eliminates the need for travel documentation and visas, and creates a smoother operation for traffickers. The demand for the sex industry has weaned since the departure of most international peacekeepers in BiH, creating, less of a supply of foreign nationals trafficked into Bosnia along with the new trafficking routes of Romanian and Bulgarian national creates a greater need to fill the demand with local females.

The Province of Kosovo-

February 17, 2008 marked the official date that the Province of Kosovo claimed independence from Serbia, and is, currently an independent state recognized by 58 United Nation Members including numbers of European Union Member States.⁵⁵ The Republic of Kosovo borders Serbia to the North and East, Albania to the West, Macedonia to the Southeast, and Montenegro to the Northwest. The capital city of Kosovo is Pristina. Kosovo endured a civil war sparked by ethnic cleansing of Ethnic Albanian by Serbian forces. The ethnic demographic in Kosovo is around 90% ethnic Albanians and the 10% ethnic Serbs. The conflict in Kosovo in 1999 forced a large percentage of ethnic Albanians to flee the province into neighboring states. The large influx of refugees created a large supply of potential trafficking victims. Similar to BiH and other war torn countries, the demand for trafficked victims increased with the presence of international peacekeepers. Kosovo serves both as an origin and destination or a long-term transit country. There are a greater number of national victims then foreign victims in the region, but the numbers are significant in both categories. From the years 2001 to 2004, there have been 568 reported and assisted national

⁵⁵ information gathered work experience at ICMPD, Vienna Austria

victims and 454 foreign victims in Kosovo. Both groups require attention from government and non-government organizations.⁵⁶

The 454 foreign nationals trafficked into Kosovo are mostly South Eastern European nationals. Moldova tops the list with the most foreign nationals trafficked into the Province of Kosovo; however, the number has decreased over time.⁵⁷ The geography of Moldova and its close proximity to Romania gives reason for the downshift of Moldovan victims transported through Kosovo. As traffickers are changing the route of Moldovan and Romanian victims the demand for sexual exploitation in Kosovo is being filled with Albanian victims. Albanian victims are increasing in Kosovo partly to do with the common language and easy of transportation from Albania to Kosovo. Albanian crimes group have been known to run most of Kosovo's illegal enterprises, therefore it is likelihood that trafficking networks in both countries work close together and are interconnected.

The age and gender of the foreign victims are consistent with the findings in the region. Most victims are between 18-25 years old and are female for the use of sexual exploitation.⁵⁸

The Republic of Kosovo is currently experiencing changes as EULEX is now taking over the UNMIK. It will take time to see if there is any improvement with the shift in police monitoring forces.

⁵⁶ Surtees 248

⁵⁷ Surtees 255

⁵⁸ *ibid*

Chapter 2: Trafficking in Human Beings: The Business Behind the Trade

The former chapters gave insight on what human trafficking is and how three separate individual states in SEE are effected by the trade. This chapter will present the way trafficking works from the beginning stages of recruitment through transportation until the final destination. Victims of trafficking's stories show the different ways traffickers recruit victims through Eastern Europe. Orphans and refugees and Internally Displaced Persons are a high risk demographic to fall under the control of traffickers.

Traffickers do not work as individuals, but rather as a team mostly composed of other organized crime members. The recruiter is the first person to come in contact with the potential victims. The recruiter is responsible for bringing the victims into the industry, either by deception or by force. The recruiter can be the individual working in conjunction with, but does not have to be a member of organized crime. The only necessary requirement is that the recruiter has a convincing story which will eventually lead the recruit to follow. If the recruiter does not belong to the overseeing illegal organization then the individual must know where to sell the victim.

Nadia's, a young girl from Moldova, story is similar to other girls who unwillingly found themselves in a life of forced prostitution. She was living a life of poverty trying to support her six year old son Steven. He was preparing to enter school; however, at this point Nadia realized that she had no money to afford the education she desperately wanted her son to receive. This was the turning moment in Nadia's life. A few months prior to this moment, Nadia had an encounter with an acquaintance who mentioned about work in Italy. Nadia never felt she was capable of leaving her son; however, believed that a few months away would allow her son to have a future life which she never experienced. The day that Nadia accepted the job offer, was the beginning of the end of the life she once knew. Over the next several

month, Nadia spendt time illegally crossing borders while being forced to participate in forced prositution.⁵⁹

Marina, another young girl who fell victim to human trafficking began her journey in Ukraine. Marina met a young man in Kiev at a local dance who promised her an opportunity to become a nurse in Germany. Marina was promised to be accompanied by another female who was also heading to Germany to start a life as a nurse. This allowed Marina to feel more comfortable about her journey. ⁶⁰ These girls willing entered the hands of traffickers after face to face communication.

In many cases the recruiter uses alternate means rather than face to face communication. Job wanted ads placed in newspapers and run by local agencies tend to appear more legitimate; however, many are just fronts for forced prositution and forced labor. In a Kiev, Ukraine newspaper, a typical adverstisment woudl state:

“Girls: Must be single and very pretty. Young and tall. We invite you for work as models, secretaries, dancers, choreographers, gymnasts. Housing is supplied. Foreign posts available. Must apply in person.”⁶¹

Work experience or formal education is not necessary and often no prefered in order to apply and receive employment at the time of acceptance. The companies promise to arrange all necessary travel documents and airfare and require no monetary costs. If the advertisement states that the travel is accomplanied it is a sure tell sign that an advertisement will lead to work in the sex industry by printing, „ bez kompleksov“ which translates into english „without complexes“, ⁶² practically informs that the work involved will involve working as a prostitute.

⁵⁹ David Batstone, Not for Sale: The Return of Global Slave Trade and How we can Fight it. (New York: Harper Collins Publishing, 2007) 168-170

⁶⁰ Farr 68

⁶¹ ibid 72

⁶² Louisa Waugh, Selling Olga: Stories of Human Trafficking (Phoenix: New Ed, 2008) 12

In accordance to face to face recruitment a new phenomenon is female recruiters who were once victims themselves. After spending time under brutal conditions and living a life of forced servitude, these women are given an opportunity to escape and try to regain the life of normacy. The stipulation is that in order to be freed from their former life in servitude, they must recruit girls to fill their spots. This is the “new process” of the trafficking in human beings. These women arrive back in their home and are dressed in fancy clothes and appear to have made a significant amount of money. Their appearance attracts girls who desperately want to make the same amount of money abroad. Females recruiting other females reduces the likelihood of suspicion.⁶³ Another theory on why many of these former trafficked victims agree to subject other women to the horrors they once faced is linked to the Stockholm Syndrome. Stockholm Syndrome is when one who was held hostage becomes extremely loyal to their captor even after enduring abuse or danger. The original term was used when a group of hostages from a bank robbery in Stockholm, Sweden became surprisingly compassionate towards the robbers; however, it now a term coined for all individuals who have been isolated and faced grave danger without the ability to escape in return develop a dependency on their abuser.⁶⁴ Whether it be a combination of both Stockholm Syndrome and the ability to escape a life of servitude, it does not diminish the fact that more and more former trafficked women are becoming the source of recruitment.

The former mentioned examples of recruitment all deal with the fact that the trafficked victim regardless of false advertising chose to partake in the originally mentioned description of employment. This differs from forced recruitment as it eliminates the option of hesitation and refusal to accept a job abroad. Forced recruitment is solely tied into organized crime. Abduction is the number one way that traffickers use force to recruit a

⁶³ Malarek 13.

⁶⁴ Waugh 236.

victim. In rural areas of Eastern Europe and the Commonwealth Independent States forced recruitment is more prominent as young girls have been reported kidnapped.⁶⁵

Naïve and desperate females are the most common victims to the sex industry; however, there are other demographics that find themselves as easy targets for trafficking organizations. Orphan children, who either have no parents or were abandoned at a young age are easy prey for traffickers. Orphan find themselves at risk of abduction and deception. The most at risk group are girls, who under the law of practices of the state, are forced to leave the orphanage once they reach a certain age, which is generally around 16 or 17.⁶⁶ Once they leave the facilities these girls do not have the adequate training in life or in education to be qualified for employment. Aside from the lack of basic skills, many children residing in orphanages throughout Eastern Europe face daily neglect and abuse. Ukraine, Romania and Russia are examples of states troubled with the lack of state funding for orphanages and the dramatic increase of children who are abandoned by family. The combination of the two lead to inhumane conditions.⁶⁷ Traffickers and recruiters use this to their advantage when offering them employment, which inevitably turns into forced labor. Previous abuse and inhumane living conditions are advantageous to the traffickers as the girls are more likely to comply and less likely to disobey their traffickers.

Recruiters are not only aware that these orphans are vulnerable, but are often aware of when they will be released from these institutions. In some cases directors and personnel are responsible for selling this information to the known recruiters. Cases have been reported by the United States of America's State Department of children living in orphanages abducted by traffickers and used for sexual exploitation.⁶⁸ Lida fell victim to abduction from an orphanage in Romania. At eighteen and preparing to leave the only place she knew as

⁶⁵ ibid 13

⁶⁶ Malarek 14.

⁶⁷ ibid

⁶⁸ ibid

home, a woman arrived claiming to be Lida's aunt. Lida had reservations about this woman's intentions; however, the orphanage confirmed her relationship to Lida and she had permission to leave with Lida. Lida had no say in the matter and reluctantly left with her new aunt. Lida's aunt turned out to be a recruiter for a trafficking operation and shortly after leaving Romania, Lida found herself on E55, a highway in the Czech Republic working as a prostitute.⁶⁹

Refugees and Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) are a unique demographic that faces the risk of trafficking through all means including forced recruitment. South Eastern Europe since the conflicts in the Former Yugoslavia and Kosovo have induced a large percentage of refugees and IDP. According to the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, a refugee is a person who:

„As a result of events occurring before 1 January 1951 and owing to well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or owing to such fear is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country; or who, not having a nationality and being outside the country of his former habitual residence as a result of such events, is unable or owing to such fear, is unwilling to return to it“⁷⁰

An Internally Displaced Person can face the fear of persecution, violations of human rights and/or armed conflict similar to those of refugees. One can only be granted refugees status upon the crossing of an international border, this is the distinguishing factor between refugees and IDPs. IDPs are displaced from their home but remain within the border of their home country. IDPs are not covered under the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees and the 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees and frequently endure hardship due to the lack of support from international communities.

The Balkans' refugee and IDP crisis dwindled following the Dayton Peace Agreement in 1995 and the official end of the Kosovo conflict in 1999. During the Kosovo

⁶⁹ Malarek 26

⁷⁰ Handbook of Procedures and Criteria for Determining Refugee Status under the 1951 Convention and 1967 Protocol relating to the Status of Refugees.

conflict, ethnic Kosovar Albanians flooded into Albania and other South Eastern European Countries. Ethnic Serbs residing in the Republic of Kosovo and the Roma minority also showed a great exodus; however, the displacement was within the Serbian Republic causing a display of Internal Displaced Persons . The United Nations Higher Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) estimated that within the week of 31 March and 2 April 1999 there were 230,000 ethnic Albanians fleeing the Province of Kosovo.⁷¹ Currently, the region still suffers from refugee and IDP problem. UNHCR reports that from the year between 2005 and 2006, 96, 000 refugees and IDPs returned to their home. In 2005 there were 600,000 remaining in the region and in 2006 the number dropped to 504,000.⁷²

Ethnic Albanians from Kosovo who are either considered refugees or IDPs have faced the greatest threat of falling into the hands of traffickers either by force or by deceit. Anna is a young Kosovar Albanian living in a refugee camp in Fier, Albania. Fier's refugees camp is a converted chicken farm in Southern Albania. Anna recalls the actions of Albanian traffickers. Men driving Mercedes-Benz with tinted windows will drive up to the fences and trying to initiate conversation with the girls. The conversation revolves around job offers in Italy as waitresses and au pairs. Anna explains that when the girls arrive in Italy they are not provided with the jobs, which they were promised. Anna, afraid for her life, refuses to leave the refugee camp without the presense of her father. The severity of the situation is exemplified when Anna left the sight of her father to use the bathroom. When her father returned, Anna was surrounded by men.⁷³ Anna's story is not unique to other refugees living within South Eastern Europe. An unnamed male refugee from Kosovo gives justification to the reason he is unable to fight for his homeland, „I would like to go out and fight in Kosovo,

⁷¹ Janine Di Giovanni, Madness Visible: A Memoir of War (New York: Knopf, 2003) 6

⁷² UNHCR Global Report 2006

⁷³ Di Giovanni 9

but how can I leave my family here“. ⁷⁴ In some cases, refugee families' economic disparity overrides the natural instinct to protect family. Family members have been known to sell female family members to traffickers in return for money. ⁷⁵ False promises and purchase from family are only two of the concerns for females living in refugee camps. Abduction is still a safety issue for many females if they venture outside of the perimeter of the camps. Anna is a good example of the possibility of abduction if her father was not present. Anna's life and all those who share her situation as refugees are plagued by financial, social and emotional upheaval. Regardless of international law for support and assistance, many feel they are incapable for protecting themselves from traffickers. In the words of Anna, „Because we are refugees, we have no rights“ ⁷⁶ Anna's fear of being trafficked controls her daily life even sleeping. She claims that she's afraid to sleep because she is aware of men outside of the camp have guns and more frighteningly power. She has witnessed females fallen to trafficking under all circumstances. Anna's allegations were confirmed by an Albanian police officer along with a French Intelligence officer.

Once the recruitment is completed the victims then begin their journey either with their recruiter and or with the transporter, who may also be called the escort or jockey. The escort's responsibility is to accompany the victims on the trip regardless of means of transportation. The escort either delivers the victims to the destination country or while in transit delivers the victims to a broker. The broker is a middle-man that buys women from the recruiter and sells them to employers. In many cases there are more than one broker throughout the complete journey. The escort is closely linked to the document forger or travel agency that is responsible for preparing false identifications that allow the victims to cross borders.

⁷⁴ Farr 73

⁷⁵ *ibid*

⁷⁶ Di Giovanni 9

Forged documents are obtained through various methods. Corrupt high ranking officials have the means to obtain passports, visas and other identification necessary for travel. These officials are associated with embassies and immigration offices around the world. The Greek Consulate in Tirana, Albania has been reported distributing visas to trafficked victims.⁷⁷ Identification distributed to victims are either issued under the victims legal name but obtained falsely, or they are drawn up using a deceased or missing persons identification.⁷⁸ A staff member at Global Survival Network, posed as a potential United States of America business partner to Sergej, a well known member of a trafficking ring in Moscow, explains the ease of obtaining false identification from Serbia. The Serbian contact uses identities of those who are missing since the civil war plagued the area.⁷⁹ Traffickers have connections throughout the world and rely on those connections throughout the entire trafficking process.

If the documents are not forged by corrupt government officials, the other option is using travel agencies and individuals who specialize in forging documents. The travel agencies and/or employment agencies often appear to be legitimate businesses who arrange all paperwork for girls to travel. In some cases the employees of agencies are acting on behalf of the criminal organization, but the owner of the agency is unaware. The company is legitimate; however the activities that occur are not. One corrupt individual can ruin the legitimacy of a company that under normal circumstances run a business legally. There are many travel agencies that are fronts for organized crime. They appear to be running a legal business; however, the all the business practices are just for the purpose of trafficking. The distinction between the two are often hard to determine.⁸⁰

⁷⁷ *ibid*

⁷⁸ Farr 78

⁷⁹ *ibid* 64

⁸⁰ Farr 62

Once a victim has documentation and enters into their first transit country, the most become aware of the type of work that is expected of them. They not only are forced to work in the sex industry, but also they are slaves in the debt bondage system. According to Farr debt bondage is „A situation in which debtors pledge their personal service against a debt they owe, but a person to whom they owe it fails to deduct the value of services from the debt, or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined“⁸¹

The debt amount that a girl is forced to pay back under the debt bondage system tends to exceed the actual cost of travel. The traffickers claim that debt is from the costs of travel, job placement, broker fee and the cost to have an escort on the journey. In addition to this debt, the traffickers add on the cost of room and board and also in some cases a fee for „protection“. The debt that a trafficked victim can incur is in the ten thousands and plus interest added on. The victims must service clients in order to pay off their debt. The debt does not easily get deducted. Due to any infraction of the rules, set by traffickers more debt will incur..⁸² For example a trafficked woman from Eastern Europe to the Netherlands was promised to receive 25% of her earnings. She was unaware that out of that 25 percent, she was forced to pay off debt and a charge for rent.⁸³ One trafficked victim had to pay off a debt to multiple parties. Part of her earnings was given to her traffickers for the rent costs and another percentage to the men who arranged for her travel. By the time all her debt was paid, she was only given approximately \$35USD per customer. The money she earned was to be used for basic needs such as food, clothes and transportation. There was little to no money left for personal savings.⁸⁴

⁸¹ Farr 25

⁸² *ibid*

⁸³ Farr 29

⁸⁴ *ibid*

Given the reality that trafficking in human beings is very present in our world it would be ignorant to state there an ideal situation for victims of traffickin; however, if victims were promised to keep part of their earnings after their debt is cleared it would be a brighter than the reality. A young female trafficked to work in the sex industry in Bosnia and Herzegovina was forced to work off her debt. The trafficker refused to let her leave the nightclub until the money was paid back; however, that debt was never completely erased.⁸⁵ A Ukrainian victims claimed that her owner explained that they had to work an addition three month even after the debt was paid and after those three months was up, she was forced to continue to work.⁸⁶ The few who are allowed to claim and save tips from clients often are forced to hand them over to their owners for infractions of rules. The owners will find minusule reasons for taking money from girls, leaving them without any financial means of escape.

Once crossed into any of these states, victims of trafficking enter what is known as the *Breaking ground*. This is the point in their journey that they will become physically and emotionally exploited. It is often the place that the victims will begin their forced servitude as prostitutes. The girls are forced to dress like prostitutes and in many cases forced to have sex with potential buyers. The potential buyers will test the girls to see how well they perform before purchasing. They are treated like animals who are on sale at the market. During this time, if any girl tries to escape or refuses the orders of the traffickers, they are punished physically. Physical abuse is carried out infront of the other girls as a technique to scare the girls into obeying. Rape is the main method of terror. Traffickers will rape girls in the presence of others to reassure their status among the girls.⁸⁷

⁸⁵ HOPES BETRAYED: Trafficking of Women and Girls to Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina for Forced Prostitution. (New York: Human Rights Watch, Vol. 14, No. 9 2002) 18

⁸⁶ *ibid*

⁸⁷ Malarek 31

Sophia, a victim from Romania reaccounts her time in spent in Serbia. Once she realized the type of work that she was expected to perform in Serbia, she initially thought that she would fight back. Sophia's strong conviction against her traffickers were shortly set aside when she witnessed the reaction from the traffickers towards another victim who fought back. The girl was Ukrainian and as she continued to refuse to have sex , she was beaten. This did not stop the Ukrainian from fighting back, until she was physically abused to the point of unconsciousness. Even though she was unconscious, the abuse continued until she was not breathing. This poor girl was carried outside, dead. After this, Sophia realized there was nothing she could do, if she wanted to stay alive.⁸⁸ The fear of these girls is palpable.

⁸⁸ Malarek 35.

Chapter 3: Trafficking in Human Beings: Who's trafficking human beings?

The purpose of this chapter is to understand the traffickers. Victims of trafficking are not focused on but rather those who partake in the trade for the benefits of monetary or personal gain. Organized crime groups run the trafficking business throughout SEE, but there are other groups such as military personnel and international peacekeepers that are continually knowingly enabling the trade to flourish in SEE.

Organized crime constitutes activities that are outside of the legal sphere of business practice. The United States Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) defines organized crime as “any group having some manner of a formalized structure and whose primary objective is to obtain money through illegal activities.” Such groups maintain their position through the use of actual or threatened violence, corrupt public officials, graft, or extortion, and generally have a significant impact on the people in their locales, region, or the country as a whole.⁸⁹ The list of activities that encompasses organized crime is extensive; it ranges from fraud to illegal trafficking of goods and people. The UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime Article 2 defines organized crime groups as “a group having at least three members, taking some action in concert (i.e., together or in some coordinated manner) for the purpose of committing a ‘serious crime’ and for the purpose of obtaining a financial or other benefit. The group must have some internal organization or structure, and exist for some period of time before or after the actual commission of the offence(s) involved.”⁹⁰

Not all organized crime a criminal offence under Transnational Crime. The UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime differentiates between what is transnational organized crime and national organized crime. Under the Convention, in order for a criminal activity to be considered transnational organized crime it must meet the following criteria:

⁸⁹ “Glossary of Organized Crime “United States of American, Federal Bureau of Investigation, <http://www.fbi.gov/hq/cid/orgcrime/glossary.htm> (Accessed in December 2007)

⁹⁰ UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime

the offence is “committed in more than one State; It is committed in one State but a substantial part of its preparation, planning, direction or control takes place in another State; It is committed in one State but involves an organized criminal group that engages in criminal activity in more than one State and finally, it is committed in one State but has substantial effects in another State.”⁹¹ Trafficking of persons tends to fall into transnational crime, due to the nature of border crossings, in some cases there are internal trafficking; however, this is a rarity.

The presence of organized crime has been an issue facing society for years; however, today organized crime has been a main beneficiary of globalization. There is a direct link between globalization and global security, leaving trafficking as the middle connecting the two. Global security has diminished because of the influx of human trafficking as an affect of globalization. The business of human trafficking is complex and organized crime groups throughout Europe have the capacity to conduct business with the least amount of complications.⁹²

Human trafficking is a subsector in the ever changing yet constant presence of organized crime. It is flourishing in an illicit global economy, which has allowed human trafficking activities within organized crime to progress across trans national borders. Organized crime has ties to both the illegal underground world as well as legitimate state agencies in the legal market. It is often difficult to distinguish the difference between what is legal and what is not. Many of the legal state agency and protection units, such as police forces have ties to illegal organized crime groups, which make it almost impossible for infiltration and to find the source.⁹³ Organized crime flourishes due to the weakness of state control following conflicts. In Serbia during the reign of Slobodan Milosevic, the state was

⁹¹ UNODC: Trafficking in Persons: Global Pattern 68

⁹² “Data and Research on Human Trafficking: A Global Survey”, (IOM, 2005) 252

⁹³ Raimo Vayrynen, “Illegal Immigration, Human Trafficking and Organized Crime” (United Nations University, 2003)

completely cut off from all international organizations such as Interpol, and international police monitoring forces. This allowed traffickers to expand its practices without the fear of international intervention.⁹⁴

Due to the illegality of human trafficking, organized crime groups around the world have become the forefront of all operations. This is especially true in South Eastern Europe. Since the end of the Former Yugoslavian Civil War, the countries lacked a stable political government and structure. This in return lead to much of the countries to be infiltrated with crime groups running all the illegal activity with little chances of being stopped. One of the largest and most notorious groups that control much of the human sex trade in Balkans are the Albania crime gangs. The Albanian crime gangs are infamous for being ruthless in their practice, whether against crime groups or with their business practices. Nothing will come between the money that is to be made and they will stop at nothing to protect their assets. Albania's crime groups are prevalent around Europe, expanding their territory to as far north as the Netherlands. Albania is focal point in all-illegal trade. Since Italy is only separated from Albania of by only 81 kilometres by ocean, Albanian crime groups have made their mark in Italy. Cataldo Motta, a prosecutor in Italy, states that the Albanians are a point of reference for all illegal criminal activities, "Everything passes trough Albania."⁹⁵

The Albanian crime groups as stated earlier, will stop at nothing to protect themselves, and that includes murder. Murdering individuals who have the ability to shut down their operations and also of the women who they are trafficking if it means the difference between getting caught and escaping. The ideology is there always be more girls so killing a few to protect themselves is not as devastating then not being able to continue business. One way that will protect their business is by throwing girls overboard en-route to

⁹⁴ Nikolic- Ristanovic 18.

⁹⁵ Farr 108

their destination of Italy, when the Italian coast guard is closing in on them. The coast guard must try to save the girls rather than continue pursuit of the traffickers.⁹⁶

The difficulties in understanding the Albanian crime groups and halting their business, is complicated, and that is the main reason they are continuing to thrive throughout Europe and North America. London has become a stomping ground for the Albanians. According to one source, the Albanians control about 70% of all brothels in London's Soho district. The Soho industry is estimated to be a 24 million dollar enterprise. The Albanians were able to prosper in this region due to its business practices of cutting prices for customers and then adding the cut costs to the trafficked person's debt bondage.⁹⁷ The ability for Albanians to travel and relocate is a new experience due to the once closed off from civilization under dictator Enver Hoxha. It was not until 1991 that Albanians have the opportunity to leave Albania progress as an independent country.

In studying the organizational aspects of mafia crime groups, there is a distinction between older and established groups such as the Italians and Russians and the new groups, which includes the Albanians. The more established organized crime groups are based on tight, hierarchical structure. The older groups are involved in the trade; however, they tend to stick to familiarity. Rather than changing their system they just add on. This taken, these groups use the same routes, networks and even the same methods to conduct their business. This makes it easier for officials to catch on and halt their operations. There is little diversity; however, with the new groups like the Albanians, they are more willing to be laterally connected, and that can be the difference in why the new groups are succeeding in the practice of human trafficking.

In addressing human trafficking and the role it plays within organized crime, there are two typologies that are used to distinguish the difference between different groups. The first

⁹⁶ Malarek 109

⁹⁷ King 48

is the UN Drugs and Crime Typology which covers the whole sphere of organized crime. The second is Louise Shelly Typology, which strictly deals with human trafficking. Human trafficking is prevalent in both typologies and through these the distinction between the old established organized groups is clear from the newer groups.⁹⁸ See Table 7.

The Albanian crime groups' structure is still a mystery to most. Since there is not tight hierarchical presence, it is difficult to pinpoint the gangs. Many experts have tried to identify how and why the Albanian groups are successfully rising in terms of mobility and avoiding detection. One expert who has spent time researching the Albanian groups, observes a very traditional hierarchy with chain of command highly based on family or clan-memberships. This observation of the Albanians does not differ from the older groups and therefore does not give a valid explanation on why they are so successful. The other explanation, which may give some more insight, is that the Albanians operate on a smaller scale and do not have a worldwide organizational structure, unlike the more established crime groups.⁹⁹ This allows the clans to have little interaction between them and a smaller chance of hitting the anti-corruption radar. The Albanian crime gangs are also known to have infiltrated all known sectors of the government in Albania. This leads to the virtual inability to be persecuted for their actions.¹⁰⁰

In order for the Albanian crime groups to succeed, they rely greatly on the well-established Russian mafia to facilitate recruiting many of the girls who will eventually be sold to the Albanian groups for the "breaking process". The Albanian crime gangs serve mostly as middlemen from receiving the girls from the Russian mafia to selling them off in Western Europe; either, to other crime groups or other Albanian crime gangs. The Albanian groups must maintain a strong relationship with the Russians in order to keep its operations

⁹⁸ Liz Kelly, "You can Find Anything you Want" A Critical Reflection on Research on Trafficking in Persons within and into Europe. Data and research on human trafficking: A Global Survey. (Geneva: IOM, 2005) 251

⁹⁹ Farr 109.

¹⁰⁰ Vayrynen 19 .

successful. Within the borders of Russia, there are over 9000 criminal organizations employing 100,000 people. Russian organized crime controls and estimated 50% of private enterprises and 60% of state run enterprises. Forty percent of the Russian economy controlled by these organized crime groups.¹⁰¹ The Russian mafia has increased its ventures in sex trafficking since 1996. At this point Moscow reported an estimate of 200 illegal sex businesses just within the city limits. These businesses were either owned or had relations to the Russian mafia. The Russian mafia is key to business due to its strong ties and connections with government and police officials. The ties to the government are a direct result of the mafia clans, which consist of former military and security personal. This allows them to conduct business across borders with ease.¹⁰² There are a variety of different mafia groups in Russia that each play a different role in the industry. The less rigid in structure are the groups that tend to work with other mafias from different ethnicities, e.g. the Albanians in the international trade. These groups are responsible for the recruitment and logistics of the operations. The more established mafia groups mostly work domestically with clubs and brothels and are responsible for keeping the lower criminal groups protected from persecution from authority.¹⁰³ The mafia in Russia has a hand in all aspects of the sex industry.

Organized crime may be in the forefront of trafficking human beings but they are benefited by the impact of militarism that faces regions especially in SEE. Both the military structure and organized crime are created on a hierarchy and possess power. Their ideology may differ; however, both play a role in facilitating human trafficking.

Militarism has always led to the increase of the sex industry since as early as World War II. After World War II, there was a high level of trafficking of persons in the

¹⁰¹ Karen Becks and Delila Amir, eds. Trafficking and the Global Sex Industry, (Maryland: Lexington Books, 2006) 67

¹⁰² Farr 99-101

¹⁰³ King 207

Philippines. When looking at the past waves of human trafficking, it has a direct link to conflict zones. In the 1970s, trafficking was prevalent in South East Asia, which was a direct outcome of the Vietnam conflict. The Civil War in former Yugoslavia has opened the doors to human trafficking. The effects of war or any military conflict and the conditions it presents in the area are prime grounds for human trafficking. It increases the demand as well as the supply for trafficking. The supply becomes ample due to the vast numbers of unemployment and poverty in a post-military conflict area.

Another reason that these women become an easy target is because of the many victims of rape during the conflict. In patriarchal societies such as Albania and most of the former Yugoslavia, women who are raped are no longer accepted back into the family. Historical Albania has prided itself on the respect and honour of a women's dignity. They were once considered property of their husband and father; however, the males were responsible to protect the women from sexual harassment and violence. If one violated the rights of a woman it was once punishable by death. The knowledge of this culture became useful in war tactics, as forces would rape women to prove not to only humiliate the women but also against the males as a way to show their incapacity to protect their women. Women's bodies become another battlefield during conflicts. Complementing the fact that rape affirms the inability of men to protect their women, "access to a women's body" is considered a reward of war.¹⁰⁴

The first report of women in the Balkans being held against their will and forced to perform sexual acts was in 1993. The article that exposed the sexual slavery occurring in Bosnia was written by a British journalist and published in Newsday. "Shame in Bosnia" opened the eyes of the general public to the horrific nature of war and sexual slavery. Serbian forces held Muslim women captive in a brothel named Sonja's Kon Tiki and forced them to

¹⁰⁴ Farr 168

perform sexual acts. These women were not only held against their will by Serbian military forces, but regular clients who visited this brothel were known UN forces in Bosnia to help promote peace. It is unclear if the UN officials were aware of the situation of the girls who were servicing them, however according to most reports there was a blatant disregard for the human rights of these women.¹⁰⁵

This type of sexual slavery occurred throughout the civil war, in Croatia, Serbia and Bosnia. The victims faced discrimination and also exile when they returned home.¹⁰⁶ This gives the traffickers an advantage on prying on these girls, knowing that they will never return back home.

After the conflicts are resolved, international forces are generally deployed to the area for peacekeeping measures. The peacekeepers and their role in human trafficking are seldom confronted and go without any intervention. One theory on why peacekeepers partake in a business that is immoral and illegal is the identity crisis of masculine warrior, which most peacekeepers are not viewed as but rather as feminized peacekeepers.¹⁰⁷ The identity of masculine warriors has been a prevalent theme throughout the Balkan crisis in the 1990s. A central theme that encompasses Serbian culture is that a warrior is the central element in the 20th Century ideal of masculinity.¹⁰⁸

A peacekeeper's job is not only to restore peace in a war-torn area but also to bring the benefits of a neo-liberal economy and world order. As part of the neo-liberal world order, peacekeepers see the sex trade as part of society that exists all over where one class, race, or gender is exploited due to the nexus of technology, power and capital that is used by a civilized society. The UN continued to benefit from this as they were often reported visiting

¹⁰⁵ Nikolic-Ristanovic 5

¹⁰⁶ Nikolic-Ristanovic 15

¹⁰⁷ Anna M Agathangelou and LHM Ling, "Desire Industries: Sex Trafficking, UN Peacekeeping and the Neo-Liberal World Order" (Brown Journal of World Affairs, Volume X Issue 1, Summer/ Fall 2003)133

¹⁰⁸ Farr 167

all types of sexual exploitation sites, whether they were brothels, Serb rape camps, and even the pornographic films that came out in these areas. The UN had a moral obligation to protect the citizens of the area and promote peace; however, their actions spoke louder than words and they in return provided the opposite. Peacekeepers have always had a great link to human trafficking. During the conflict the trafficking was mainly within the border of the former Yugoslavia. It was not until afterward when the push came to transport girls and women from other Eastern European nations. As mentioned in the former section on organized crime, organized crime groups fuel the trafficking market. The peacekeepers involved are not helping the overall good of the area, but on the contrary are supplying the organized crime groups with capital. As these peacekeepers continue to avoid prosecution, the concept of criminality is seen as accepted in the region.¹⁰⁹

The Dayton Peace Agreement that ended the civil war in the Balkans under Annex-1, Appendix B stated that the NATO troops and civilian personnel sent to secure peace are titled to the rights of the “1946 Convention on Privileges and Immunities of the UN” under Article IV.¹¹⁰ Article VI, Section 22, states “immunity from personal arrest or detention and from seizure of their personal baggage and in respect of words spoken or written and acts done by them in the course of the performance of their mission, immunity from legal process of every kind.”¹¹¹ International Police Task Force (IPTF) and all UN personal are also covered under Article V of “The Convention on Privileges and Immunities of the UN”, which carries similar rights to Article V¹¹² In Section 23 under Article VI and Section 19, there is a stipulation that the United Nations has the right to waive immunity if their actions are against

¹⁰⁹ Sarah E. Mendelson, Barracks and Brothels: Peacekeeping and Human Trafficking in the Balkans, (CSIS Press, 2005) 17

¹¹⁰ The General Framework Agreement: App. Annex 1A. Appendices to Annex 1A Agreement on the Military Aspects of the Peace Settlement. . 14/12/1995
http://www.ohr.int/dpa/default.asp?content_id=378.

¹¹¹ Hopes Betrayed 46.

¹¹² Hopes Betrayed 47.

the good of the mission. Partaking in human trafficking activities qualifies as a reason to waive immunity; however, there have been no cases reported that any IPTF officer had their immunity waived. The UN response to any allegations of partaking in a trafficking enterprise was repatriation to the officer's home country.¹¹³

Once peace was regained in the area, human trafficking for sexual exploitation continued to rise. The ever-present gunfire and war casualties seemed to exist but women were still not safe. NATO and the UN sent a large convoy of peacekeepers to remain in the area and facilitate with peace agreements. An UN Police Officer with the Trafficking in the Prostitution Investigation Unit in Kosovo stated “ Here we are UN Peacekeepers trying to establish Law and order and they're out getting freebies from girls being forced into sex slaves”.¹¹⁴ Unfortunately, the organizations cannot be held accountable for the actions of a few peacekeepers that partake in the encouragement of trafficking. In Kosovo, over 1.5 million US dollars is made in profits from human trafficking in 2001; however, in 1999 there was virtually no sex industry in the area. Peacekeepers entered after the conflict with Serbian nationalists in 1999.¹¹⁵

The brothel locations are in close proximity to peacekeeper areas. The Arizona Market is a prime example. Human rights and anti-trafficking activists have claimed that one can determine which type of international delegation is stationed in various areas based on the names of brothels. In Kosovo, near the US sector, the brothels have names such as “Malibu Club”, “Monroe Club” and “Liberty Restaurant” as opposed to the French section where the clubs are named “Café Bashta”, “Café San Bar” and “Picasso”. The regular patrons to these establishments tend to be foreign visitors many of which are involved with

¹¹³ ibid pg 60

¹¹⁴ Malarek 209.

¹¹⁵ Lindstrom11

NATO and SFOR (the NATO Stabilization Force in Bosnia).¹¹⁶ Visiting well-known brothels with trafficked persons is not the extent that the UN and other peacekeeping troops partake. Their involvement in the trade goes as in depth as forging documents for the trafficked women, aiding the illegal transport over border checkpoints and even giving the sex club owners inside information when a raid will occur. The Associated Press in Eastern Europe brought these allegations to the public's attention.¹¹⁷

Civilians around the world joined international peacekeeping forces sent to Bosnia. Kathryn Bolkovac, an American citizen from Nebraska opened the eyes of the world to the horrors of trafficking and the peacekeepers involvement. DynCorp, an American company who hired American police officers on behalf of the US state department to serve in Bosnia on the UN mission employed Kathryn Bolkovac. Bolkovac worked for the International Police Task Force (IPTF) Gender office. Her task as an officer of IPTF was to interview rescued trafficked victims, which led to the discovery of the peacekeepers involvement in trafficking. Bolkovac inevitably lost her job for reporting on DynCorp and other organizations involved. Bolkovac skipped over the chain of command and reported her findings to top officials in the area. Her findings included the involvement of entry of trafficked victims into Bosnia with the assistance of NATO officers. Local police intercepted a vehicle driven by a NATO officer with four Moldovan females as passengers. When the local police interviewed the women, they explained that they entered Bosnia illegally and were sold into prostitution. Transportation is not the only means that International Peacekeepers play a role in trafficking. An American soldier purchased a trafficked woman for 1,000 USD and kept her locked in his apartment for the use of sex.¹¹⁸ United Nations Mission in Bosnia and Herzegovina reported to "Human Rights Watch" that the practice of

¹¹⁶ Mendelson 11

¹¹⁷ Agathangelou 134

¹¹⁸ Malarek 163.

peacekeepers involved in purchasing females is widespread; however, the peacekeepers claim it's a method of "saving" the females from further trafficking.¹¹⁹ The peacekeeper may have noble intentions; however, the practice of purchasing the females regardless of their motives is illegal. The ITPF has the ability of intervening and rescuing trafficked victims through legal means such as police investigations and raids on known brothels and bars harbouring trafficked victims. ITPF does not only have the means but also the obligation toward this approach rather than the outright purchase of a human victim.¹²⁰

A relevant issue when discussing trafficking with international forces that are frequent customers to brothels is the misunderstanding of the differences between prostitutes and trafficked victims. It is illegal to facilitate prostitution and to operate a brothel, but it is legal to purchase sex under both the law of IPTF and in BiH.¹²¹ They tend to make the mistake in what is a dispositional condition, the women who consciously make the decision to sell their bodies for sex, prostitutes, from the women who are in an environmental condition, those who are being forced.¹²² The IPTF should be aware of the likelihood that brothels in Bosnia hold trafficked victims. The training and work experience gives the officers ample knowledge of the trafficking issues that reside in the area and when they are unwilling to acknowledge this fact they break the IPTF code of conduct as well as the local laws. This lack of acknowledgement of the trafficked persons leads to the lack of action taken by the forces whether or not they are partaken in the purchasing of sex. Aside from war related rapes, historically the military would use prostitutes as a form of Rest and Relaxation (R&R)¹²³

¹¹⁹ Hope Betrayed 49.

¹²⁰ *ibid* 49

¹²¹ *ibid* 49

¹²² Mendelson 29

¹²³ Farr 171

Chapter 4: Why Trafficking is Flourishing in Today's World?

European Union and Schengen-Crossing European border

Globalization has had an effect on the how the trade is being conducted; who is trafficking human beings and most importantly as seen throughout this chapter how trafficking is changing with new information technologies and the expansion of the European Union and Schengen Agreement. The internet is the greatest threat to combating human trafficking with the pornography being the number one most searched for item on the internet and the most profitable.¹²⁴ Pornography and its connection to the internet and human trafficking is discussed throughout most of this chapter.

With open and unregulated borders due to new treaties and/or conventions it only takes a matter of days, if not hours for a typical trafficked person to cross multiple international borders and/or even continents. Today crossing borders is significantly easier than ten years ago. Visa waivers, the expansion of the European Union, the Schengen Agreement all have helped facilitate the movement of people from one state to another within the European Union either legally or illegally. The European Union is politically based on creating an “Area of Freedom, Security, and Justice”.¹²⁵ These three principles, in order to be practiced throughout the Union, must first tackle the pressing issue of human trafficking. The human trafficking trade denies its victims of freedom, security and justice. The Europe Union is an easy target for trafficking syndicates to exploit and prosper.

The expansion of the European Union has dramatically increased the ease of transportation of goods and people within the European Union and allowing traffickers easy access throughout the Union with its lenient borders. In 2004, there was the first expansion

¹²⁴ Mary Eberstadt, “Is Pornography the New Tobacco?” Policy Review. (California: Hoover Institute, Stanford University, April and May 2009, No. 154) 4

¹²⁵ Janice G Raymond PhD, “Public Hearing on “Impact of the Sex Industry in the E.U”, (European Parliament: Committee on Women’s Rights and Equal Opportunities, 2004) 3

of the European Union, which added states of the former Communist Bloc. The 2004 expansion included the states: Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary, Slovenia, Poland, Lithuania, Latvia, Estonia, Malta and Cyprus. The Current EU-27 was completed on January 1, 2007 with the accession of Romania and Bulgaria, opening these states to the same freedoms and opportunities of the original members of the European Union.

The European Union borders are now shared with the states facing the gravest issues regarding human trafficking. Romania and Bulgaria are known trafficking source countries and currently part of the European Union, which implies that these citizens are now holding European Union citizenship. This eliminates the issue of traffickers providing illegal documentation for travel. Recruiters can simply lure the potential victims into the deception of lucrative work within other European Union States; however, upon arrival the truth of their occupation is often disclosed- the sex industry. Documentation is still required to travel within European Union states however it is less regulated if travelling by auto and train within the Schengen countries.

The concept of freedom of movement of persons along with migration controls has been a strong a topic of debate among European States. Since the creation of the European Community, European states were torn between how to enforce this freedom while keeping with restriction. Some states argued that internal border checks where to remain for the distinction between EU and non EU nationals. On the other hand there were states that were pro- eliminating internal borders and allowing all persons to move freely across state borders.

126

¹²⁶ The great divide among states prevented a mutual agreement. In 1985, response to those states who favoured keeping internal border checks, France, Germany, Belgium, Luxembourg and the Netherlands created a territory which had no internal borders. They named this territory the Schengen area, after the town Schengen, Luxembourg where the treaty was officially signed. It took ten years from the original signing and another draft of the treaty before it came into effect. In 1995, the signing members removed internal border checks keeping only external border checks with those countries that were not participants. At the external checks, visa requirement and passport control was monitored before entering the territory. Once a person was through the external control, he or she had free movement within the territory.

Migration is what prompted the European Union to develop such internal policies such as the Schengen Territory and its regulations.¹²⁷ Migration is the cause for the world in which we live and interact today. Migration is based on economic, social and political factors that are existent around the world including within the European Union. Voluntary migration is the way of life, relocating for a better life, a better job, a bright future and it can be both legal and illegally handled. Involuntary migration can also occur under legal statute, in case of fear of persecution or a threat to personal safety. Most commonly found involuntary migrants are in search for political asylum and can be granted refugee status under the UNHCR convention of refugees.¹²⁸

Illegal migration falls into two categories, voluntary and involuntary. A young Moldovan female who can not find suitable work due to the dreary economic conditions that face her country decides to move to Italy in order to make a living and support herself and her family. She does so without proper documentation and devises a plan to smuggle into

The Schengen area expanded in 1997 with the addition of eight joining member states following the Treaty of Amsterdam. The additional members of Schengen are as following in order of signing: Italy, Spain, Portugal, Greece, Austria, Denmark, Finland and Sweden. "The Schengen area and cooperation". (Activities of the European Union, Summaries of Legislation)
<http://europa.eu/scadplus/leg/en/lvb/l33020.htm>

¹²⁷ In order to keep with EU regulation on migration, the Member States adopted measures to keep a level of consistency. According to the European Union's Summary of the Schengen legislations the main measures are:

- The abolition of checks at common borders, replacing them with external border checks
 - A common definition of the conditions for crossing external borders and uniform rules and procedures for checks there;
 - Separation in air terminals and ports of people traveling within the Schengen area from those arriving from countries outside the area;
 - Harmonization of the conditions of entry and visas for short stays;
 - Coordination between administrations on surveillance of borders (liaison officers and harmonization of instructions and staff training);
 - The definition of the role of carriers in measures to combat illegal immigration;
 - Requirement for all non-EU nationals moving from one country to another to lodge a declaration
 - The drawing up of rules governing responsibility for examining applications from asylum seekers (Dublin Convention, replaced in 2003 by the Dublin II Regulation);
 - The introduction of cross-border rights of surveillance and hot pursuit for police forces in the Schengen States;
 - The strengthening of judicial cooperation through a faster extradition system and faster distribution of information about the enforcement of criminal judgments;
- The creation of the Schengen Information System (SIS). *ibid*

¹²⁸ Becks 4

Italy. By successfully doing so she is an illegal migrant; however, she is not a victim of trafficking.

Human trafficking, along with other forms of illegal migration, has benefited from the Schengen Territory's expansion into Central and Eastern Europe. Once a trafficked victim successfully enters into the Schengen territory, usually by forged/illegal documents or smuggling, they have the ability to be bought and sold from traffickers in various European Union States without the fear of getting caught during transportation. Once they reach their destination, the only responsibility is to avoid any interaction with police enforcement.¹²⁹ If the traffickers and the victims can manage to evade the police, their operation will continue to prosper.

Along with the expansion of the European Union, the Schengen territory has also expanded in recent years. This new expansion creates a smaller surface area for transit from countries of origin to a participating Schengen country. In the past, in order to secure a victim in the Schengen territory from the Russian Federation, the traffickers would experience external borders not only exiting the country but as they move West until they reached the borders of Germany, Italy, and or Austria. Today the number of external borders is reduced and in some routes, traffickers will only have to pass one border before entering the Schengen states of Latvia and Lithuania. Poland shares a border with Belarus and Ukraine, which also is a high- level origin country. The victims from South East Europe are currently only separated from Schengen States by water in the West such as Italy all other neighbouring states are Schengen. In the North, SEE neighbours Hungary, a new member of Schengen, and to the South Greece. The current trends in routes possible will shift in accordance to the expansion of Schengen. There is the potential that traffickers will reroute

¹²⁹ Craig McGill, Human Traffic: Sex, Slaves and Immigration, (London: Vision Paperbacks, 2003) 165

victims eliminating the Balkan area as a transit region and transport directly to states that are members of Schengen.

The easier mode of transportation to avoid speculation is ground, via trains or automobiles. The borders do not exist and one can drive directly into another state without showing documentation. Air travel has also relaxed its borders for those who hold European Union passports however; it is still necessary to provide identification for travel, which may deter traffickers from using this mode of transportation in transporting victims.

The expansion of the European Union and Schengen is also changing the routes traffickers have been known to use in trafficking humans. The shift of transportation patterns leaves many unable to monitor and intercept traffickers. Albania, one of the states most known for its transit nature, is expanding into an origin country and loosing its transit capabilities. There is no longer the need to bring foreign women into Albania and other Western Balkan countries, when the Eastern Balkans provide easy access into European Union and Schengen controlled states.¹³⁰

The European Union expansion leads to the concept of us vs. them. It also is an economic border between the West and the East. European Union Member states before the accession to the Union must have met financial stability requirements. Economics drives the sex trade and it is prevalent when dealing with origin and destination countries as mentioned in the former sections.

Economic factors play an important role in all business practices. Capitalism in the sense of supply and demand helped create the world economy that is present today. The key is to find the equilibrium between supply and demand for any good or service and labour market. With globalization as a fact of life, it must be addressed in terms with the global market and the changes that it brings forth. Kofi Annan, the Former UN Secretary-General

¹³⁰ Waugh 75

discussed his concerns at the Davos World Economic Forum, January 1999 where he stated, “But I believe we have underestimated its fragility (globalization). The problem is this: The spread of markets out spaces the abilities of societies and their political systems to adjust to them, let alone to guide the course they take. History teaches us that such an imbalance between the economic, social and political world can never be sustained for very long”¹³¹. These three worlds are not sustained under the pretext of human trafficking. Society and political governing powers are not equipped to handle the ways that trafficking rings are implemented within state borders.

The difference between any other labour market and the human trafficking market is exploitation. Traffickers have complete control over the victims turning them from human beings into commodities for sale.¹³² The force and abuse used to keep the victims from escaping create an ever-lasting supply that can be used over and over again unlike other types of goods. In respect to drugs, once the supply of drugs is sold, the dealer must find a new source of supply in order to continue making a profit; however, with human beings, one can resell the beings creating an unlimited amount of profit before needing to re-fill the supply.

Since the market is exploited and the supply does become exhausted quickly, the demand is high. As long as there is the need for sexual gratification, there will always be a need for trafficking in beings. The demand is also increasing with the anonymous nature in which one can now purchase a human being from the internet. As long as the risk of getting caught remains slim and the punishments light, the demand will continue to rise. The complex and shifting aspect is the supply. The supply of females can be seen in “push conditions”. Push conditions are weak economies, high unemployment rates, population

¹³¹ Paul Graham Taylor, International organization in the age of globalization (Continuum International Publishing Group, 2005) 167

¹³² Joanna Apap, Peter Cullen and Felicita Medved, “COUNTERACTING HUMAN TRAFFICKING: PROTECTING THE VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING”(Centre for European Studies) 6

growth, and internal strife that can be found in most source countries.¹³³ The vulnerability of these countries is prime ground for traffickers to expand their supply.

Economic factors may provide an environment suitable for recruitment, but it also its economic factors that depict destinations for the supply. In addition to the push conditions mentioned above, the economic status of a country may also incorporate the human development index, GDP per capita and internal economic inequality. The United Nations Human Development Report gives the most accurate and influential data. The UN Human Development Index (HDI) is based on four variables: life expectancy at birth, adult literacy, school enrolment of children and GDP per capita.¹³⁴ Destination countries are represented by low HDI. Source countries are represented by higher HDI and those who fall in between tend to be transit states.¹³⁵

The focus is predominantly on the victims of trafficking and how the HDI index provides empirical evidence to measure countries trafficking activity. It is also important to note that economic conditions and the other variables that play a role in HDI create the demand and supply for traffickers. Traffickers' involvement is solely based on monetary gain. The trade provides high profits and profession despite its illegal nature. The reasons traffickers enter the trade vary but in all cases the underlining fact is for money. In countries with high HDI along with low HDI, trafficking is an easy way to provide financial stability. Females are also beginning to venture into trafficking industry as traffickers rather than victims due to the large profits that potentially can be made.

¹³³ *ibid*

¹³⁴ Farr 144

¹³⁵ *ibid*

The Internet and Trafficking:

Does human trafficking require the physical illegal transportation of a human? What if an image of a human is being transported across state borders illegally and along while obtaining a profit that the human does not benefit from? ¹³⁶ The internet has brought out an entire new venue for trafficking women and one of its newest means is through pornography. An internet pornographic site states the relationship with technology and pornography: “Technology is driven by adult entertainment...because sex then sells the technology” ¹³⁷ In the United States more money is spent on purchasing pornography than on any other form of performing arts. In the United Kingdom thirty-three percent of internet users access porn. ¹³⁸ In the United States of America, the newest report states that 25% of employees that access the internet during the workday visit pornographic websites.¹³⁹ Since pornography is mainstream due to the easy access of the modern day internet, human trafficking rings have taken their business online. Money keeps trafficking rings and pornography in business so the combination of the two lead to a higher margin of profits. The internet has made a once booming business into an unstoppable market with men lining up to purchase a woman. ¹⁴⁰.

It is first important to distinguish the difference between erotica and pornography as they are often intertwined. Pornography is defined as “material that combines sex and/or the exposure of genitals with abuse or degradation in a manner that appears to endorse, condone, or encourage such behaviour”¹⁴¹ Erotica is far less invasive where it is defined as “sexually suggestive or arousing material that is free of sexism, racism, and homophobia and respectful

¹³⁶ Kathleen Maltzahn, “Digital dangers: Information & communication technologies and trafficking in women”. (APC WNSP, 2006)

¹³⁷ PORNOGRAPHY: DRIVING THE DEMAND IN INTERNATIONAL SEX TRAFFICKING. California: Captive Daughters, (2007) 95

¹³⁸ Raymond 1

¹³⁹ Anna Kuchment and Karen Springen, “The Tangled Web of Porn In the Office” (Newsweek: Nov 29, 2008 *From the magazine issue dated Dec 8, 2008*) 1

¹⁴⁰ Malarek 81

¹⁴¹ Pornography: Driving the Demand in International Sex Trafficking, 19

of all human beings and animals portrayed”.¹⁴² When speaking of pornography, it is only of those images that are degrading and abusive, which is often where the trafficking problem lies. There is a small line between what is acceptable erotica and what is pornography as the two are generally grouped into one large category of adult entertainment. According to Professor Catharine Mac Kinnon, a professor of Law at University of Michigan’s School of Law, pornography is alone a form of sex trafficking. There is a movement of images and sexual exploitation without any limitation to time and more to be profited.¹⁴³ Pornography is mainstream among everyday viewers and almost everyone is capable of discovering pornography to their tastes on the internet. The ease at which one can discover pornography representing any or all fetishes leads to the increase of prostitution visits. In many cases the fetish that one views on the internet increases the desire to act out the fetish rather than be limited to internet/pornography viewing. In some instances the fetish may be to extreme for a wife or girlfriend to be willing to participate, hence the physical need to purchase sex in order to fulfill the fetish. Research was conducted in 9 countries interviewing 854 women who were involved in prostitution. Out of these women forty-seven percent stated that they were forced to perform acts that their clients have seen in pornographic material.¹⁴⁴ The prostitute is likely to be a victim of trafficking continuing to fuel the need for a higher supply.

¹⁴⁵

Viewing pornography is only one aspect of the relations between pornographic material and sex trafficking. Anyone willing to participate in the pornographic industry can do so with a camera. The participants can be either forced or voluntarily. It no longer requires professionals to make and sell adult videos. The well-known and common video

¹⁴² Pornography: Driving the Demand in International Sex Trafficking 19

¹⁴³ Pornography: Driving the Demand in International Sex Trafficking 19

¹⁴⁴ Melissa Farley, Prostitution, Trafficking and Traumatic Stress. (Haworth Press Inc, 2004) 44

¹⁴⁵ Raymond 1

streaming site YouTube is a place for amateur video makers to place their work on the internet for all to view. Taking the same concept, pornography also has their very own “youtube” known as “you porn”. “You porn” is a website where amateur filmmakers can upload homemade pornographic videos for anyone’s viewing pleasure. This site brings back the original opening question of this chapter. Is it trafficking if one’s image is being transported across international cyber borders? “You porn” can be an example of how one’s image involuntary may end up on the internet for all to view.

Pornography has yet to be seen as a widespread issue among the scholars and advocates against human trafficking. Reasoning is that internet pornography is often subtle and hard to track therefore there is no conclusive evidence that the women are victims of trafficking. The act of prostitution whether it is forced or voluntary, is in direct correlation increases the need for pornography just as pornography lead to the demand for prostitution. They are interchangeable, without one the other loses its level of demand and with the demand for prostitution still high there is a demand for prostitutes, which is filled largely by trafficked women. There are specific clubs where clients are notified that their interaction with women they purchased will be videotaped. The footage can be used in any way the owner feel fit. This often led to pornographic videos that can be accessed via the internet.

Trafficked women within the sex business, aside from working in brothels, strip clubs, or street prostitutes, are often forced to be videotaped having sexual encounters with men, which are then made into pornographic videos. Leading to the next business venture becoming more and more common among trafficking rings are interactive sex shows. The world -wide web has sprung a new spin on the average brothel. Rather than clients or customers physically visiting a brothel, they are able to access online brothels or interactive sex shows via the internet. The process is simple and can be accessed from the comfort of one’s home and all it requires is an online payment and web camera. Clients log on to a

website, select a woman or women of choice via pictures and the interactive show begins. The selected woman/women enter a room also equipped with video equipment and the customer on the other end of the computer may use the women to fulfill every last desire or request. There is no risk of disease, embarrassment of being seen leaving a brothel and it cuts down on travel costs.¹⁴⁶

One of the biggest internet forums for traffickers to communicate and purchase women is also a website for the average person to locate pornography boasting the use of slaves. The site “slave farm” is self-proclaimed to be the largest amateur Bondage, Discipline, Sadism and Masochism (BDSM) site since 1998. One can become a member and then is granted special footage. To entice viewers to become members, the website states:

“Our own beautiful sluts are being trained for you to enjoy. A full Slavefarm membership will give you access to both the world’s largest collection of amateur BDSM/Bondage material and all the material we make with our own slave sluts. We take requests so let us know how you would like to see the slaves trained”¹⁴⁷

The membership also includes access to purchase, sell or rent a slave for personal use. This has become a particular host benefiting human traffickers. The site does not shy away from posting despite the law. They explicitly post the age, nationality and the fact that she is essentially trafficked and the selling price. The postings also site the type of work the “slave”/ victim is willing and able to perform. One particular posting from New York City, USA states that a girl, age 17, personally imported from Russia and is available for sale to be used as a prostitute, or as an actress for adult material. The post also includes a nude photo of the young 17-year-old female.¹⁴⁸ Another posting on Slavefarm explicitly stated and confirmed that the slave potentially will be trafficked international. The post sited that the buyer must provide the woman with essential paperwork required for traveling internationally. Once the paperwork was in order the seller would sign the women to a ‘slave

¹⁴⁶ Malarek 92-93.

¹⁴⁷ Pornography Driving the Demand for International Sex Trafficking 261-262

¹⁴⁸ *ibid* 264

contract” taking all of her rights away and given to the purchasers.¹⁴⁹ This posting, among the multiple others that are offers to sell women for sexual exploitation, are the perfect network for traffickers to locate, women use them to facilitate their prostitution, and pornography business practices.

Pornographic websites are very often associated with sexual tourism. Internet users casually browsing the internet for pornography may find him/herself viewing sites that not only advertise pornography but also sexual tourism and trafficking. Given the number of internet users who view internet pornography, pornography has become a main advertising tool for sexual tourism and purchasing beings for sexual exploitation. Advertisement is the collaboration between pornography and forced sexual exploitation. One of the largest sites that use this method of combining sexual tourism and pornography is DexterHorn.com. DexterHorn’s web page is created and ran out of California, USA and gives visitors one-stop shopping for all their sexual needs. It’s main focus is pornography, the reason many viewers happened to come across the page; however, one can easily discover links and how-to publications varying between how to purchase a women or make an home made pornographic video. Titled “To Rent or Buy,” one of DexterHorn’s publications speaks volumes on their support in trafficking and sexual exploitation of women. Apart from their own publication, Dexter Horn advertises other companies’ sex tours. One specific is G&F Tours of New Orleans. G&F uses Dexter Horn’s pornography website to promote their sex tours and establish customers.

Unlike Dexter Horn and G&F Tours who use pornography to entice the concept of sexual tours, Viking Exotic Tours reverses the advertisement structure. It operates sexual tours to the Dominican Republic where the girls have been known to be originally from

¹⁴⁹ ibid 265

Central and Eastern Europe. Viking Exotic Tours spreads their name and operation through mainstream media sources such as men's themed magazines.¹⁵⁰

Viking Exotic Tours clearly partake in trafficking young women from their home country representing the source country to the Dominican Republic, the final destination country. Viking Exotic Tours is unique in one aspect where customers may choose to attend Porn Week. Porn Week is a special feature that allows tourists to create and star in their own pornographic video using the girls they experience on their travels, combining trafficking, pornography and sexual tourism into one business.¹⁵¹

Sexual Tourism is defined by the "World Tourism Organization," a subsector of the United Nations as "trips organized from within the Tourism Sector, or from outside this sector but using its structures and networks, with the primary purpose of effecting a commercial sexual relationship by the tourist with the residents at the destination."¹⁵² The trend of sexual tourism has shifted over the past decade. The original trend was to internationally trafficked beings that would be later sold into sexual slavery. The beings originated from lower economic status states and transported to wealthy, economic sound states such as in Western Europe and North America. Although this method is still predominately used today, there has been a shift occurring especially with the rise of sex tours. Sex Tourism has replaced the need for trafficked beings out of their native state with importing sexual exploiters to the origin state. Partakers in sexual tours visit countries where they can exploit the women without the running the risk of transporting and trafficking laws.

Independent sexual tourism is not without its guidance from online websites. World Sex Guide is a forum for anyone who is looking for sexual gratification regardless of location. The World Sex Guide claims to have 6000 members; however, it is not necessary

¹⁵⁰ *ibid* 270

¹⁵¹ *ibid*

¹⁵² Kerry L. Neal, "Preventing Child Sex Tourism: Legal Responses and Private Sector/Community Partnerships." www.unicef-irc.org/worldcongress3/neal_ppt.pdf (Accessed 25 March 2008)

to join to view postings or gather information¹⁵³. Membership is required though to post on the website. World Sex Guide is broken into categories of world regions and then into specific nation states. It gives accounts of fellow independent sex tourists on who, what and where they purchased sex and how much. It explicitly states which taxi drivers to ask, what newspapers to purchase, and what bars to patron in search for purchased sexual gratification.

Concerned citizens have also visited the site and posted against the use of trafficked victims that may be the source of one's sexual pleasure. One gentleman comments that it is not unlikely that some of this women have been brought to the brothels mentioned in postings by force and have their basic human rights violated. He openly admitted to using the services provided by brothels; however, later became aware of the situation and thought it was appropriate to speak out for the victims. His posting created outrage from other readers. One specific response stated, " So what's your point, huh? You want to be a social-worker go work for www.gov. This is a board for men who want to get laid not for those wanting to hear slash wrist and violin stories"¹⁵⁴

Organized sex tours like Viking Exotic Tours and G&F, which use pornography to lure in patrons, eliminate the legwork of the individual and prepare an all inclusive holiday with the sole purpose of sex. Global Sex Tours is an internet portal geared strictly and solely to sexual tourism. The site focuses on destination countries including Czech Republic and Germany among others. Once the destination country is decided, one is brought to a separate page for that country. Then one can select the type of holiday they desire. It claims to arrange travel, accommodation and as many women as you can desire. There is no detailed description of the women which will be at your every disposal, however it does state the obviously, beautiful, young and willing to fulfill your every fantasy. Global Sex Tours is set apart from

¹⁵³ Malarek 78

¹⁵⁴ Malarek 95.

other internet sexual tourism portals as it does recognize the issues of human trafficking in each destination and providing a legal statement against the use of trafficked women. It however, is unclear since there is no concrete evidence to verify that the women they use are not victims but willing participants.

Sex tours often involve the incentive of finding a willing bride and live happily ever after. Mail- order bride firms organize holiday for gentlemen searching for a spouse abroad. The most common location for mail order brides is the Russian Federation and other former Soviet Union states. Men will travel to the state where they will be induced to a variety of women who believe that they about to meet the man of their dreams and escape their economic or personal worries. Mail-order bride agencies often neglect to do background checks on the males and are motivated solely by monetary gain. There are no checks or inquires to establish if the males have a criminal record or if they are currently married with children. On the other hand, the females who enter the services are obliged to fill out thorough questionnaires and undergo extensive medical examinations. This misguides the women to believe that the men they will be potentially meeting will have undergone similar requirements.¹⁵⁵

The process of discovering a world of mail-order brides is simple. Within ten minutes one can discover an array of firms via the internet that offer such services. Most of the leg-work can be done at home; pictures and mini-biographies are posted on the sites where men can search through to find the woman of their dreams. The women in the photos are more than often dressed mainly in undergarments if they not nude. Some companies offer email services so the potential groom can begin correspondence with the women of their liking before the face-to-face meetings. Other companies arrange travel to the source country and

¹⁵⁵ “Human Trafficking: Mail Order Bride Abuses” (HEARING before the COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN RELATIONS UNITED STATES SENATE ONE HUNDRED EIGHTH CONGRESS SECOND SESSION, Tuesday, July 13, 2004) 2

the men meet various women in person before picking their bride to be. Once the to-be bride has a serious match and the monetary exchange from male to agencies is confirmed, then the woman is at the disposal of their new husband. The scary truth is that most of these brides end up returning to the home state of the groom and forced to work in prostitution, domestic labour and/or other slavery. Some of the sites proclaim that it is cheaper to purchase a “wife” than to continue to pay for prostitution and there is an added bonus of housework and cooking. There is no hiding behind the fact that the men are simply looking to exploit these women¹⁵⁶, especially since many of the women offered do not speak another language other than their native Russian or etc.¹⁵⁷

The mail-order bride agencies are simply a front for organized crime and human trafficking syndicates. These agencies, if not solely used for international human trafficking are often collaborating with well-known trafficking rings. One of the largest issues is can mail order bride agencies be classified as traffickers? The United States of America, Central Intelligence Agency, stated, “mail order bride brokers...are not traffickers per se; but, where there is deception or fraudulent non-disclosure of known facts concerning the nature of the relationship being entered into or the criminal or abusive background of the client, the brokers should be liable as traffickers.”¹⁵⁸ The problem remains that there is no international law on how a broker for a mail order bride should be prosecuted. The same is applied to individuals who use the agencies to obtain women that later will go on to forced prostitution. There is no difference of an individual purchasing a woman for sexual exploitation from another individual (trafficker) or from an agency. As of 2004 in the United States, there were

¹⁵⁶ Malarek 12

¹⁵⁷ Malarek 92

¹⁵⁸ *ibid*

zero reports of an individual being brought to trial for purchasing a woman using a mail order bride agencies and then promoting forced prostitution.¹⁵⁹

Above all tourism is a key component in increasing the economy of a state and when the pivotal tourism industry is based around sex, it enables the traffickers to continue their practices while the governments are merely concerned with and increase of tourism and improvement in economy. The internet promoting pornography and sexual tourism are aspects that need to be the main focus in prevention and policy to eradicate the trafficking practices of today. The internet is no longer accessible by the wealthy and powerful. Today, every country in Europe has at least limited internet access. In Albania, Kosovo and the rest of the Balkan countries internet cafés line the streets where young adults can visit for minimal costs. There are no controls over the information that one can access.

New social networks such as Facebook, Myspace and High Five allow communication between friends either across town or across the globe. These social networks are also a common ground for people to meet and start relationships. The danger is that there are no security measures and traffickers can use this to their advantage. An example how these social networks can be enable traffickers to recruit potential victim of trafficking can be as simple of a young man in Italy befriending a woman in Bulgaria and after a online relationship ask the Bulgarian female to visit Italy to meet. The Bulgarian female no longer needs a visa to enter since becoming a European Union Member State in 2007. Once arriving in Italy, the truth is that she is now kidnapped and forced to participate in the sex industry. Simple everyday websites are becoming the newest source for traffickers. A very popular website in the United States and spreading worldwide is Craig's List. On Craig's List one can search for rooms to rent, people can sell old furniture, possibilities are endless. Recently Craig's List was found to be a forum for selling human beings. Non-pornographic websites

¹⁵⁹ *ibid* 3

have become mainstream in today's society, but in reality there are also used for trafficking purposes.

Conclusion: The Worlds Response to the Globalized rise in Human Trafficking

As new information technologies continue to improve, it seems as though those inventing and benefiting are two steps ahead than those who are trying to prevent and eradicate the practice of trafficking human beings. Governmental agencies and International Organizations are implementing programs and policies as a response to the growing problem of trafficking in human beings and the uses of new information technologies. The new information technologies and globalization can be used to better the research and improve the efficiency of eradicating practices of human trafficking throughout the world. In the same respect that trafficking syndicates are using new information technologies to communicate and conduct business, government agencies and social services can be used in the respect to communicate and share information and ideas across borders.

The International Organization for Migration and the International Centre for Migration Policy Development (ICMPD) are two of the many international organizations that focus their efforts on eradicating human trafficking. The gaps and needs found throughout various fact finding missions carried out by the formerly mentioned organizations along with various NGOs and other international organizations create the policies and projects that are conducted daily.

A main goal both IOM and ICMPD is in the area of data collection. The lack of empirical data for both the victims and the traffickers is one of the gravest issues facing research in trafficking of human beings. There is no transnational or national software created for the collection of data. Lack of comprehensive data sets poses an issue in the creating of policy due to the fact that many policies and projects are created without a full understanding of the demographics that it will be implemented for. Age, country of origin, profession, level of education and so on are all important data sets that can shape and improve a policy or law for both aiding the victims of trafficking and eradicating the

traffickers' enterprise. It is important for a comprehensive database to have several security measures especially being data privacy. Data privacy is one of most importance, as personal information cannot be available to the public. A comprehensive database would not only help with policy creating and implementation but also with assistance and repatriation if applicable. It would provide insight for NGOs dealing with victim assistance and also governments on how to handle victims before repatriation or before criminal/civil case hearings.

The most influential work that ICMPD, along with eight national governments is to create a Transnational Referral Mechanism (TRM) for countries dealing with both origin and destination status. In the past, NGOs and governments relied on professional courtesy to deal with assistance of VoT. The TRM will allow each professional throughout the identification process, first assistance, repatriation, and civil/criminal hearing to cooperate across borders. It allows for direct communication and lowers the chances of the victim to become re-victimized. Each level of the government, the police force, and the social services must follow the guidelines in order to be successful in identification and assistance.

The greatest step that can be done to help combat the practices of trafficking is through education. Educating young people on the dangers of becoming a victim is highly important in those countries that are at high risk for being the source for traffickers. Besides the human trafficking specific education, general education should be a priority for governments. Through personal experience living and working with children in a small village near Tirana, Albania, the children regardless of gender only attend schooling for three hours a day. The females often are required to end their education around the age of 14. These children are not given the opportunity to continue their education due to both tradition in the case of the females and lack of infrastructure in the case of all children only attending school for three hours a day. The more education a child receives the less likely they will

become a risk for human trafficking. Education is the first step in preventing, especially internet education. Teaching young children the dangers of the internet can help prevent future victims of trafficking.

Abstract:

The practice of trafficking has many different facets; drug trafficking, arms trafficking and human trafficking complete the top three illegal trafficking practices today. Human trafficking may be the third highest illegal trafficking practice, however there is inadequate mainstream information on the affects of the trade and horrifying issues that incorporate trafficking in human beings. This paper will discuss how the globalized world has been enabling trafficking in human beings with a concentration on South Eastern Europe. In the future this hopefully will not be a pressing issue that needs to researched and discussed but until then raising awareness and education is the best solution in combating human trafficking. In today's time trafficking of women for sexual exploitation is rapidly growing in South Eastern Europe and is known to be in the fourth wave.¹⁶⁰ Trafficking affects almost every country in the world and is significantly higher during different periods of history. Since South Eastern Europe is currently a breeding, transportation and in some cases a destination country, it is an integral region dealing with human trafficking, which must be examined. Unlike the other waves of human trafficking, the fourth wave has an added trigger and enabler of globalization. Studying how Globalization is enabling Human Trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation in the Balkans since the fall of the Iron Curtain is a topic that is ever changing. Each and every day, there are new discoveries on the ways and methods traffickers are using technology and the changing world to increase productivity of their business.

¹⁶⁰ Taken from Malarek's "The Natasha's" on page 6, the first wave was in Southeast Asia in the 1970; the second wave took place in Africa in the 1980s; the third wave was in Latin America.

Table 1:

European Rankings of Countries

Incidence of Reporting of Origin Countries:

Very High	High	Medium	Low	Very Low
Albania	Czech Republic	Bosnia and Herzegovina		The Netherlands
Belarus	Estonia	Croatia		
Bulgaria	Hungary	Kosovo		
Lithuania	Latvia	Serbia and Montenegro		
Republic of Moldova	Poland	Slovenia		
Romania	Slovakia	The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia		
Russian Federation				
Ukraine				

Table 2: The UNODC Rankings for Origin, Transit, and Destination Countries

Countries of Origin:

Number of Sources	Citation Index Rating	Total Number of Countries
1	Very Low	13
2-4	Low	30
5-10	Medium	46
11-23	High	27
24-49	Very High	11
Total Number		127

Countries of Transit:

Number of Sources	Citation Index Rating	Total Number of Countries
1	Very Low	38
2-3	Low	19
4-5	Medium	21
6-10	High	14
11-13	Very High	6
Total Number		98

Countries of Destination:

Number of Sources	Citation Index Rating	Total Number of Countries
1	Very Low	98
2-3	Low	27
4-10	Medium	50
11-24	High	21
24-40	Very High	10
Total Number		137

Table 3: Regional Clearing Point and Number of Victims of Human Trafficking in Origin Country

Country or Province of origin/year	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	Total
Victims of SEE nationality						
Albania ¹⁰	219	445	375	345	366	1750
Moldova	319	382	329	313	300	1643
Romania	163	261	243	194	193	1054
Bulgaria	46	96	164	172	143	621
The Province of Kosovo ¹¹	54	67	165	192	90	568
BiH	0	0	8	17	29	54
Serbia	0	1	10	13	21	45
Croatia	0	0	1	1	6	8
Montenegro	0	0	2	3	5	10
Macedonia	0	0	0	14	12	26
SEE countries/entity total	801	1252	1297	1264	1165	5779

Victims of other nationalities, assisted in SEE

Ukraine	68	97	104	47	41	357
Russia	7	22	21	5	4	59
Belarus	8	9	1	2	1	21
Georgia	0	3	2	0	2	7
Czech	0	0	2	0	0	2
Hungary	1	0	0	0	0	1
Latvia	1	0	0	0	0	1

¹⁰ The numbers presented in the table above differ from those presented in the RCP's first annual report, meriting some explanation. The 1200 Albanian victims (presented in the first annual report as "the minimum number of identified and assisted Albanian minors trafficked primarily for begging and forced labour", in fact, referred to the number of families receiving social assistance from Help for Children/Ndihme Per Femijet (NPF) and Terre des Hommes (Tdh). The beneficiaries included both trafficking victims and those "at risk" of trafficking. As such, the RCP has amended this information in its second annual report, presenting only cases of assisted trafficking victims. The RCP apologizes for this error.

¹¹ While Kosovo is a province within the State Union of Serbia and Montenegro, in this analysis it is separated out as a distinct entity in an effort to analyze the specific trafficking context of the province. This is done in an effort to provide a more detailed picture of trafficking patterns, trends and profiles within and between each country/entity of the region. It should in no way be read as a political statement on the part of the RCP.

Lithuania	0	0	1	0	1	2
Mongolia	0	0	0	2	0	2
Slovakia	0	0	0	1	1	2
Slovenia	0	0	0	0	1	1
Italy	0	0	1	0	0	1
Iraq	0	0	0	0	1	1
Morocco	0	0	0	0	1	1
Uzbekistan	0	0	0	3	0	3
China	0	0	0	0	2	2
Kazakhstan	0	0	0	1	0	1

Table 4:

TOWNS OF ORIGIN OF ALBANIAN VICTIMS OF SEXUAL EXPLOITATION, 2002 TO 2004

Towns	2002	2003	2004
Vlora	53	56	54
Fieri	12	45	37
Lushnja	23	34	26
Berati	0	21	36
Bat	14	0	0
Tirana	55	10	13
Elbasan	12	9	14
Kucove	5	9	11
Durres	23	9	13
Sarande	14	6	6
Gramsh	7	5	0
Mallakaster	0	3	0
Fushe Kruja	1	3	0
Gjirokastra	1	3	3
Delvine	0	3	1
Tepelena	2	2	0
Skrapar	0	2	6
Permet	0	0	2
Librazhd	4	2	1
Korce	8	0	2
Lezhe	4	2	0
Kruje	6	1	0
Mirdite	0	1	1
Peshkopia	6	1	0
Rrogozhine	0	1	0
Shkoder	10	1	0
Peqin	0	0	1
Burrel	0	1	0

Kavaje	3	0	0
Cerrik	7	0	0
Lac	7	1	3
Pogradec	4	0	1
Tropoje	5	1	0
Bulqize	2	0	0
Total	288	231	231

Table 5: Regional Clearing Point

Bosnia:

COUNTRY OF ORIGIN OF FOREIGN VICTIMS ASSISTED IN BIH, 2000 TO 2004

Country of Origin	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004	Total
Belarus	1	4	1	1	1	8
Bulgaria	0	0	1	0	1	2
Germany	0	0	0	1	0	1
Hungary	1	0	0	0	2	3
Moldova	97	80	109	38	27	351
Romania	65	89	92	12	14	272
Russia	2	6	11	4	1	24
Serbia and Montenegro	2	6	6	9	9	32
Ukraine	32	15	32	15	24	118
Unknown ¹⁰⁷	0	0	23	12	0	35
Total	200	200	275	92	79	846

Table 6: INTENDED DESTINATION OF FOREIGN VICTIMS ASSISTED IN BIH, 2003 AND 2004

Intended Country of Destination	2003	2004
BiH	42	46
Czech Republic	1	1
Greece	0	1
Hungary	0	1
Italy	11	12
Serbia and Montenegro	4	6
Slovenia	1	0
Spain	1	0
Unknown	32	12
Total	92	79

Table 7: Data and Research on human Trafficking: A global Survey, IOM, 2005

UN Drugs and Crime Typology Organized Crime	Louise Shelley Typology Human trafficking
<p>Standard Hierarchy (most common-China and Easter Europe)</p> <p>Single leader Clear hierarchy Internal discipline Named group Social /ethnic identity Violence integral Influence/control over particular territory</p>	<p>Natural Resource Model (post-Soviet organized Crime)</p> <p>Primarily trafficking in women Use like natural resource Sell to near trading partners High Violence and human rights abuses Often “break” women before leave country of origin</p>
<p>Regional hierarchy (Japan and Italy)</p> <p>Single leader Line of command Some regional autonomy Geographical reach Multiple activities Often social/ethnic identity Violence integral</p>	<p>Trade and Development (China)</p> <p>Mainly smuggling of men for labour exploitation, 10 per cent women Control all stages to maximize profit Some profit invested in legitimate entrepreneurship in Thailand and China Less abuse and violence as has investment in continued profit</p>
<p>Clustered hierarchy (least common)</p> <p>Number of groups Stronger as network System of governance Some autonomy Link to a social/historical context</p>	<p>Supermarket-low cost, high volume (Mexico)</p> <p>Facilitate illegal entry across border Small fees, large numbers Extent of failures, need for multiple attempts keeps fees low Investment patterns similar to those of migrants-into land and property</p>
<p>Core group (3 in western Europe)</p> <p>Core group surrounded by loose network Limited numbers Tight, flat structure</p>	<p>Violent Entrepreneurs (Balkans)</p> <p>Almost all trafficking in women Middlemen for Russian organized crime Increasingly integrated as take over sex businesses in destination countries Involvement of top level law enforcement in own countries Use profits to finance other illegal activities and invest in property and business elsewhere Considerable violence</p>
<p>Criminal network</p> <p>Linking activities of individuals Positions by virtue of networks and skills Personal Loyalties Alliances around projects Low Public profile</p>	<p>Traditional slavery with modern technology (Nigeria and West Africa)</p> <p>Multi-faceted crime groups Use female recruiters and trade in girls Small amounts returned to local operators and families to maintain flow</p>

Bibliography:

1. Agathangelou, Anna M and L.H.M Ling. *“Desire Industries: Sex Trafficking, UN Peacekeeping and the Neo-Liberal World Order”* Brown Journal of World Affairs. Summer/Fall 2003; Volume X, Issue 1. Pages 133-148.
2. Apap, Joanna, Peter Cullen and Felicita Medved “COUNTERACTING HUMAN TRAFFICKING: PROTECTING THE VICTIMS OF TRAFFICKING” Centre for European Studies (CEPS)
3. Batstone, David. Not for Sale: The Return of the Global Slave Trade and How we can Fight it. Harper Collins Publishing: New York, NY 2007
4. Captive Daughters Media, eds, PORNOGRAPHY: DRIVING THE DEMAND IN INTERNATIONAL SEX TRAFFICKING. Captive Daughters Media, California: 2007
5. “Collateral Damage: The Impact of Anti-Trafficking Measures on Human Rights around the World”, Global Alliance Against Traffic in Women (GAATW): 2007
6. Di Giovanni, Janine. Madness Visible: A Memoir of War. Knopf; 1 edition 2003
7. Eberstadt, Mary. “Is Pornography the New Tobacco?” Policy Review. No.154 Hoover Institution, Stanford University, Stanford California: April and May 2009
8. El-Cherkeh, Tanja Stirbu, Elena Lazaroiu, Sebastian Radu, Dragos “EU-Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe”. Hamburg Institute of International Economic, Germany: 2004
9. Farley, Melissa. Prostitution, Trafficking and Traumatic Stress. Haworth Press Inc: 2004
10. Farr, Kathryn. Sex Trafficking: The Global Market in Women and Children. Worth Publishers, New York: 2004
11. Friman, Richard and Simon Reich, Human Trafficking, Human Security, and the Balkans. University of Pittsburg Press, Pittsburg, PA: 2007
12. Lindstrom, Nicole. "Regional Sex Trafficking Networks and International Intervention in the Balkans" *Paper presented at the annual meeting of the International Studies Association, Le Centre Sheraton Hotel, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, Mar 17, 2004*
13. “Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime” United Nations, 2000
14. Hajdinjak, Marko. “Smuggling in Southeast Europe”, Center for the Study of Democracy Sofia, Bulgaria: 2002.

15. HOPES BETRAYED: Trafficking of Women and Girls to Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina for Forced Prostitution. Human Rights Watch, Vol. 14, No. 9 New York: November 2002
16. Kanics, Jyothi. "Arizona Market: Woman for Sale," Stop-traffic: News/Bosnia, 2000.
17. "Human Trafficking: Mail Order Bride Abuses" HEARING before the COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN RELATIONS UNITED STATES SENATE ONE HUNDRED EIGHTH CONGRESS SECOND SESSION, Tuesday, July 13, 2004
18. King, Gilbert. Women, child for sale: The new slave trade in the 21st Century. Chamberlain Bros. New York : 2004.
19. Kuchment, Anna and Karen Springen, "The Tangled Web of Porn In the Office" Newsweek: Nov 29, 2008 *From the magazine issue dated Dec 8, 2008*
20. Malarek, Victor. The Natashas: Inside the New Global Sex Trade. Arcade Publishing. New York: 2004.
21. Maltzahn, Kathleen. "Digital dangers: Information & communication technologies and trafficking in women". APC WNSP, **November** 2006
22. McGill, Craig. Human Traffic: Sex, Slaves and Immigration. Vision Paperbacks, London: 2003.
23. "First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe" Regional Clearing Point. September 2003.
24. "Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns" United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. April 2006.
25. "Data and research on human trafficking: A Global Survey" International Organization for Migration. 2005
26. Mendelson. Sarah E. "Barracks and Brothels: Peacekeepers and Human Trafficking in the Balkans". CSIS Press. February 2005.
27. Trafficking and the Global Sex Industry. Edited by Karen Becks and Delila Amir. Lexington Books. Lanham, MD 2006.
28. Nikolic-Ristanovic, Vesna. "*Sex Trafficking: The Impact of War, Militarism and Globalization in Eastern Europe*" Michigan Feminist Studies: 2003; 17; Gender Watch.

29. Raymond, Janice G. PhD. Public Hearing on “Impact of the Sex Industry in the E.U”, Committee on Women’s Rights and Equal Opportunies, European Parliament: 2004
30. The General Framework Agreement: App. Annex 1A. Appendices to Annex 1A Agreement on the Military Aspects of the Peace Settlement. 14/12/1995
http://www.ohr.int/dpa/default.asp?content_id=378. (Accessed on June 2008)
31. Taylor, Paul Graham. International organization in the age of Globalization. Continuum International Publishing Group, 2005.
32. “The Schengen area and cooperation”.Activities of the European Union, Summaries of Legislation. <http://europa.eu/scadplus/leg/en/lvb/l33020.htm>
33. United States, Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights and Labour, Country Report on Human Rights Practices in Albania .Department of State, Washington: 2008
34. Vayrynen, Raimo. “*Illegal Immigration, Human Trafficking, and Organized Crime.*” United Nations University, WIDER. Discussion Paper No. 2003/72. October 2003.
35. Waugh, Louisa. Selling Olga: Stories of Human Trafficking New Ed, Phoenix: 2008
36. BusinessDictionary.com. WebFinance, Inc: 2007-2009
<http://www.businessdictionary.com>
37. Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary. Merriam-Webster Online. May 2009
<http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary>